Violence against Women and Girls, Infrastructure and Cities

*Briefing Paper*

**Produced for:**
31 March 2017

**Authors:** Dr. Erika Fraser, Dr. Kalpana Viswanath and Laura MacLean
About the ICED Facility

Infrastructure and Cities for Economic Development (ICED) is a flexible facility designed to accelerate and scale up DFID’s investment in the next generation of transformative urban and infrastructure programming. It promotes economic growth and poverty reduction in some of the most fragile countries through politically sensitive, resilient and inclusive programming.

Country and regional offices and DFID programme design advisers can access rapid technical assistance for scoping and programme design from a pool of sectoral experts as well as action research, policy briefings and consultations.

Technical experts are drawn from across the ICED alliance which is managed by PWC and includes Adam Smith International, Arup, Engineers Against Poverty, the International Institute for Environment and Development, MDY Legal and Social Development Direct.

This report has been peer reviewed by DFID and ICED advisors: Victoria Spencer (DFID), Ian Curtis (ICED), Sue Phillips (ICED) and Vidya Naidu (ICED).

Aim of this Briefing Paper

The overall purpose of the paper is to provide a framework for how to address violence against women and girls (VAWG) through programming and policy dialogue on infrastructure and cities. It aims to support DFID advisors and programme managers to integrate VAWG as an important consideration of all urban and infrastructure programming and policy dialogue.

How to use

This paper is divided into four key parts, which are designed to work independently of each other or together as one resource document:

- **Overview** – short 2-pager summary of the key issues, with a table of how to address VAWG through urban and infrastructure programmes.
- **Section 1** provides a brief introduction to VAWG and why it matters to urban and infrastructure programmes.
- **Section 2** identifies the key risks and opportunities for each of ICED’s seven entry points, as well as during the construction phase. These sub-sections are also intended to be short stand-alone briefs to help the integration of VAWG into sectors (e.g. Energy, WASH).
- **Section 3** highlights some of the conditions for success – what is needed for a programme to be transformative. It concludes with ideas for getting started.
# CONTENTS

Overview

1. What is VAWG and why does it matter to urban and infrastructure programmes?
   1.1 What do we mean by Violence against Women and Girls? 8
   1.2 What is the scale of the problem? 8
   1.3 Why does VAWG matter to urban and infrastructure programming? 11
   1.4 What is the economic case for tackling VAWG in urban and infrastructure programmes? 15

2. Suggested entry points for urban and infrastructure policy and programming
   2.1 Introduction 17
   2.2 Safe space & security (with focus on public spaces) 20
   2.3 Transport 25
   2.4 Water and sanitation 28
   2.5 Energy 32
   2.6 Land & housing rights 35
   2.7 Formal workers 38
   2.8 Informal workers 42
   2.9 Construction 46

3. What are the conditions for success? Case studies and examples of promising practice
   3.1 Introduction 49
   3.2 Women and girls as agents of change 50
   3.3 Tackling the social norms that drive VAWG 51
   3.4 Addressing VAWG through coordinated urban planning and governance 52
   3.5 Digital innovation 54

Next Steps: Getting Started 56

Annex 1: Bibliography 57
Annex 2: International Commitments on VAWG and Safe and Inclusive Urban Spaces 71
Annex 3: Safe Cities Programmes 73
Annex 4: Examples of indicators 74
OVERVIEW

1 in 3 women experience some form of physical and sexual violence in their lifetime.
Safe, inclusive and well-planned public spaces, infrastructure, urban services, and transport can reduce violence and harassment that women and girls face and increase access to economic opportunities.

This briefing paper provides a framework for how to address violence against women and girls (VAWG) through infrastructure and cities programmes. It aims to support DFID advisors and programme managers to integrate VAWG in urban and infrastructure programming.

Creating safe and inclusive urban environments is a top priority for the UK government, who have signed up to several international commitments in this area, including Sustainable Development Goal 11 to ‘make cities and human settlements inclusive, safe, resilient and sustainable’, with a target that directly contributes to addressing women and girls’ safety in public spaces.

DFID have committed to addressing VAWG in its sectoral programmes, including in urban and infrastructure programming. This is partly in response to reviews by the International Development Committee (IDC) and Independent Commission for Aid Impact (ICAI), which challenged DFID to scale up its high quality and innovative programming and integrate VAWG into wider sectoral programmes.

VAWG is important for DFID’s infrastructure and cities programming for several reasons:

- Violence and the threat of violence holds back economic growth in urban areas, limiting women’s mobility, access to economic opportunities, and the ability to move into higher paid or more secure jobs. For example, in Mexico City, World Bank funded research¹ found women living on the periphery of the city are making difficult decisions over the trade-off between economic opportunity and personal security, as women’s earnings are three times higher in the city centre, but over half experience sexual harassment on public transport.

- Violence limits the success of urban and infrastructure programs aimed at improving access to resources and services (e.g. health, education, jobs). For example, a UN Women scoping report² found that over half (55%) of women in Port Moresby, Papua New Guinea experienced some form of sexual violence in market spaces in the previous year. These safety concerns meant the local population and tourists were not going to markets.

¹ Dominguez Gonzalez (2016)
² UN Women (2014)
• Sexual harassment and violence also has considerable costs which undermines economic growth. The cost of violence against women ranges from 1.4% to 3.7% of Gross Domestic Product (GDP), according to recent costing studies within developing country contexts.

• Context is important. Urban and infrastructure development in unstable, and post conflict/humanitarian situations give rise to particular challenges.

• Construction projects, particularly of major infrastructure, represent high risk environments for VAWG. This includes risks both to women and girls in the local community, as well those in the project-affected area such as those living in or providing services (traders, sex workers) to the construction camp.

• Better planning of urbanisation and infrastructure has the potential to create safer environments. However, effective operations and maintenance is essential to ensure the reliable provision of services. Street lights with no power, bus services that don’t run, no water at the standpipe all serve to increase risks.

Creating an urban environment that is safe and inclusive for everyone means recognising different concerns and vulnerabilities around VAWG, for example younger women and adolescent girls, elderly women, IDPs and refugees, and people who transgress gendered norms.

Growing urbanisation can increase patterns, risks and types of violence, but can also present opportunities for women and girls. Section 2 identifies the risks of VAWG in each of ICED’s seven entry points (safe spaces; transport; water and sanitation; energy; land and housing rights; formal and informal workers), as well as some opportunities and promising practices.

ICED’s framework for gender and inclusion acknowledges that not all DFID urban and infrastructure programmes can be transformational, but all programmes should respond to the needs and vulnerabilities of marginalised groups as a minimum requirement. It guides programming from a basic ‘do minimum’, through to ‘empowerment’, and eventually ‘transformation’.

The following table maps these opportunities onto ICED’s gender and inclusion framework. This table can act as a starting point for discussion, noting that the extent to which an intervention is truly empowering or transformative depends on ‘how’ it is implemented in practice. It should be noted that the list is not definitive, but based on some of the key practices used to date.

**Conditions for long-term success:**

- Tackling the social norms that drive violence
- Including women and girls as agents of change
- Addressing VAWG through coordinated urban planning and governance
- Digital innovation
**How to address VAWG through ICED’s entry points?**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Safe space and security</th>
<th>‘Do Minimum’</th>
<th>‘Empowerment’</th>
<th>‘Transformation’</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Programmes that address basic needs and vulnerabilities of women and marginalised groups</td>
<td>Programmes that build assets, capabilities, and opportunities for women and marginalised groups</td>
<td>Programmes that address unequal power relationships and seek legal, institutional and societal level change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Safety audits • Improve safety at and around transport hubs including bus stops • Female-only transport (a contentious solution) • Plan road crossing with VAWG in mind, e.g. open truss bridges and not underpasses</td>
<td>• Communications campaigns to raise awareness of VAWG</td>
<td>• Engaging men and boys to change social norms on VAWG, including on intimate partner violence • Address the links between VAWG and wider urban violence e.g. drug trade • Training to help develop the knowledge and skills of police to respond in an effective and appropriate way to VAWG</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Transport |                | • Use transportation infrastructure to raise awareness of VAWG • Work with transport workers to report trafficking and sexual exploitation | • Train transport workers to be more gender-sensitive |
| Transport |                | • Install and maintain street lighting • Improve community electrification and increase access to affordable electricity • Improved access to / provision of solar lamps • Support access to energy for women entrepreneurs has potential to protect women from VAWG, by contributing to female economic empowerment | • Policies, strategies and codes of conduct that ensure prevention of VAWG is incorporated into WASH provision • Work with communities – men and women- to prevent and respond to VAWG in WASH provision |

| Water and sanitation |                | • Advocacy and communications around VAWG • Train and build the capacity of WASH programme staff • Women’s WASH groups or platforms to discuss and propose strategies to reduce violence | • Major energy programmes work with local women’s groups to identify opportunities to prevent and respond to VAWG |
| Water and sanitation |                | • Involve vulnerable women in decision-making on the siting, design and management of facilities • Female attendants for female only latrines. | • Policies, strategies and codes of conduct that ensure prevention of VAWG is incorporated into WASH provision |

<p>| Energy |                | • Long-term safe housing options and asset security | • Reform of discriminatory laws which deny a woman’s right to inherit and/or own land |
| Energy |                | • Emergency shelters for women escaping violence | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Formal workers</th>
<th>Informal workers</th>
<th>Construction</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Reporting and redressal mechanisms for formal workers</td>
<td>• Legal support to informal workers who have experienced violence</td>
<td>• Ensuring social safeguards are in place to mitigate and address risks, including sexual harassment policies, Environmental &amp; Social Impact Assessment (ESIA) procedures, reporting frameworks and robust grievance mechanisms</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Training and awareness-raising in the workplace, either targeted at particular individuals (managers, counsellors) or at the entire workforce.</td>
<td>• Providing safe workspaces for informal workers</td>
<td>• Ensure safe working environment for women construction workers free from harassment and fear of violence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Targeted multi-component programmes for particular sectors (e.g. sex work)</td>
<td>• Building in an anti-trafficking prevention component</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Social norm change targeted at construction workers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Unions, collective action and dialogue around VAWG</td>
<td>• Policy and legal reforms</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Protective legal and policy frameworks</td>
<td>• Collective action and advocacy by women working in the informal economy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Social norm change in the workplace</td>
<td>• Social norm change targeted at construction workers</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
SECTION 1: What is VAWG and why does it matter to infrastructure and cities programmes?

1.1 What do we mean by violence against women and girls?
Violence against women and girls (VAWG) is a serious human rights concern and a major public health problem. About 1 in 3 women worldwide have experienced either physical and/or sexual intimate partner violence or non-partner sexual violence in their lifetime, according to global estimates published by the World Health Organisation. The social and economic costs of violence are enormous for individuals, and have ripple effects throughout families, communities and society, lasting for generations. In line with its international and national commitments, preventing VAWG is a top priority for the UK Government and DFID.

Definition: The United Nations defines violence against women and girls as “any act of gender-based violence that results in, or is likely to result in, physical, sexual or psychological harm or suffering to women, including threats of such acts, coercion or arbitrary deprivation of liberty, whether occurring in public or in private life.” (General Assembly Resolution 48/104 Declaration on the Elimination of Violence against Women, 1993)

The most common forms of violence against women and girls include: domestic and intimate partner violence; sexual violence (including rape) and sexual harassment; and emotional/psychological violence. Sexual violence as a tactic of war and after emergencies is also common in fragile and conflict-affected settings. Other widespread forms include: sexual exploitation, sexual trafficking, and harmful traditional practices (e.g. FGM and child marriage). Less documented forms include: economic abuse, political violence, widow-related violence (including accusations of witchcraft), elder abuse, dowry-related violence, acid-throwing, prenatal sex selection, female infanticide, and crimes committed in the name of ‘honour’.

1.2 What is the scale of the problem?
The world’s population is increasingly urban. Over 4 billion people, more than half (54%), currently live in urban areas. Projections show that migration to urban areas, combined with the overall growth of the world’s population, could add another 2.5 billion people to urban populations by 2050, with close to 90% of the increase concentrated in Asia and Africa.

---

3 WHO/MRC/LSHTM (2013)
4 DFID (2014a)
5 UN Women (2015a)
6 UN Department of Economic and Social Affairs (2016)
Worldwide, women and girls face considerable levels of harassment and violence in urban spaces and on transport systems. Reliable global statistics on VAWG in public spaces and on transport infrastructure are limited; there are serious gaps in the availability of systematically and ethically collected data. The map overleaf features survey findings on women’s experiences of harassment and violence in several countries. Due to differences in methodology, these statistics are not directly comparable; however, they do highlight the global scale of the problem of sexual harassment and violence on public transport and in urban spaces.

A survey into women’s safety on transport in 16 of the world’s largest capitals ranked Bogota, a Colombian city with a network of red buses but no city trains, as the most unsafe city for women to use public transport and the most unsafe city for women to travel alone at night. Mexico City had the highest percentage of women saying they have been physically and verbally abused on public transport. The survey found that 6 in 10 women in major Latin American cities had been physically harassed while using transport. Compared to other cities, Moscow respondents had the least confidence that authorities would investigate an abuse report, while women were least confident that other people would come to their assistance in Seoul if being abused on public transport.

The lack of reliable global estimates on the scale of violence and harassment in urban areas and transport is partly due to underreporting – only 7% of women report violence to a formal source, such as the police. There has been some analysis of population-level surveys which explores how the incidence of violence against women varies by rural/urban location. A large multi-country study by the World Health Organisation (see figure below) found that physical and/or sexual violence against women by male partners is higher in rural areas than in cities, while violence by a non-partner is higher in urban areas. Another multi-country study also noted that women more likely to report partner violence in urban areas in Bolivia, Haiti and Zambia, but found the opposite was true in Kenya, Moldova and Zimbabwe.

---

7 Fulu (2016)
8 Some studies focus on particular cities, others on urban areas across countries
10 Note: actual percentages not publically available
11 Palermo et al (2014). However, studies suggest that women survivors of violence are more likely to seek help and file a complaint in urban areas for a variety of reasons: closer proximity to police posts; greater availability of support services; as well as increased awareness of the unacceptability of violence in urban areas (Chant and McIlwaine, 2016; McIlwaine, 2013).
12 McIlwaine (2013)
13 Kishor and Johnson (2008)
Statistics: Sexual harassment and violence in public spaces and on transport infrastructure

- **Kampala, Uganda**: 80% of girls do not feel safe (Travers et al, 2013)
- **London, UK**: 75% have been subjected to harassment or violence in public (ActionAid, 2016)
- **Gujranwala, Pakistan**: 96% experienced street harassment (Bargad, 2013)
- **Port Moresby, Papua New Guinea**: 90% have experienced some form of sexual violence on public transport (UN Women 2014)
- **Brazil**: 89% of women living in cities have been subjected to harassment or violence in public (ActionAid, 2016)
- **Thailand**: 86% of women living in cities have been subjected to harassment or violence in public (ActionAid, 2016)
- **Egypt**: 99.3% of women had experienced some form of sexual harassment (UN Women, 2013a)
- **Ecuador**: 68% of women experienced some form of sexual harassment and/or violence in public spaces during the previous year (UN Women, 2011)
- **Egypt**: 99.3% of women had experienced some form of sexual harassment (UN Women, 2013a)
1.3 Why does VAWG matter to urban and infrastructure programming?

Violence and the threat of violence hold back economic growth in urban areas, limiting women’s mobility, access to public space, access to education, markets, and economic, political and social opportunities, and the ability to move into higher paid or more secure jobs. These gendered exclusions ultimately limit women’s ability to participate as full and equal citizens in urban life and infringe on ‘women’s right to the city’. One interesting extension of the right to the city has been to the right to leisure and the right to ‘loiter’ (have fun and hang out in public spaces). Safety should not limit women and they should be able to exercise their right to take risks as well. Women are always taking calculated risks in their lives; safety should not be seen as a way to further limit women’s mobility.

“The right to the city” is the right of all city inhabitants to have equitable access to all that a city has to offer and also to have the right to change their city in the ways that they see fit. This right has given birth to a worldwide social movement, whereby the right to the city is a vehicle for social change. However, the right to the city has not been realised equally for men and women. ActionAid’s multi-country report on ‘Women and the City’ notes that: “A woman can enjoy her right to the city, when she lives free from violence and the fear of violence, and free from rights violations that arise in the spaces where she lives and works.”

(Sources: Harvey, 2008; Whitzman et al, 2013; Taylor, 2011; Brown and Khristiansen, 2009)

---

14 Based on data from WHO (2005) multi-country study of seven countries (no comparison data between rural/urban for Bangladesh, Ethiopia and Namibia)
15 Pozarny (2016); Taylor (2015); Chant and McIlwaine (2016); McIlwaine (2016)
16 For example, the Indian social media campaign #whylotter, where 2 million women posted photos of themselves ‘loitering’ or having fun in public spaces, including dark alleyways (Mukherji, 2015)
17 Phadke et al (2011)
In line with its international commitments, creating safe and inclusive urban environments is a top priority for the UK Government. As outlined in Annex 2, a number of global commitments have underlined the increasing prioritisation of the issue. Notably, the Sustainable Development Goals, adopted in 2015, include the specific goal 11 to ‘make cities and human settlements inclusive, safe, resilient and sustainable’, with a target that directly contributes to addressing women and girls’ safety in public spaces. The New Urban Agenda (NUA), adopted in October 2016, sets out its vision of inclusive cities including ‘preventing and eliminating all forms of discrimination, violence, and harassment against women and girls in private and public spaces’.  

Three International Conferences on Women’s Safety have also been organised, resulting in the Montreal Declaration in 2002, the Bogotá Declaration in 2004 and the Delhi Declaration in 2010. Further, UN Women has launched a flagship program on Safe Cities and Safe Public Spaces with participation of 22 cities around the world. They have held three Global Leaders Foras in Cairo (2011), New Delhi (2015) and Mexico City (2017) which help to raise awareness and foster learning among cities. Engage in these conferences provides a useful opportunity for DFID to influence international policy on women’s safety in cities.

Many women work in public spaces (e.g. retail/transport workers in both the formal and informal economy) or their daily routine involves them travelling through public spaces/transport routes. Women’s reluctance to use public transport and public spaces because of fears of violence or harassment can limit the success of urban and infrastructure programs aimed at improving access to resources and services (e.g. jobs, health, and education). For example, in Colombia and Guatemala, women dropped out of night schools in increasing numbers, due to fears for their personal safety after dark. There is also the important principle of safety in numbers. Deserted streets and alleyways are likely to be more dangerous than streets with people going about their normal business. There is a critical tipping point where streets change from places to safely be; to places to avoid. Factory shift workers travelling at the same time are likely to be safer than the hotel cleaner or waitress travelling at night alone.

A woman might also forgo a well-paying job for one paying less that is closer to her home due to fears of violence. For instance, World Bank funded research in Mexico found that women in the peripheral community of Tláhuac face a real risk of violence when taking public transport to Mexico City centre, with data suggesting 50% of women in Mexico have experienced sexual harassment on public transport.

19 Moser and McIlwaine (2004)  
20 Personal communication, Ian Curtis  
21 World Bank (2015)
However, women’s earnings are on average three times more in the city centre, leaving women with a difficult decision to make over the trade-off between economic opportunity and personal security. In another study, it was found that women working in the IT sector in Bangalore shared that personal safety was the key determinant in deciding mode of transport.

Creating a safe and inclusive urban environment means recognising different concerns and vulnerabilities and leaving no-one behind. Some women and girls are more at risk of violence than others, including younger women and adolescents, elderly women, women who live in poor communities and/or precarious dwellings where break-ins are easy, recent migrants, IDPs and refugees, women who transgress gendered norms, and women in certain occupations, to name a few. Inequalities based on factors such as age, disability, ethnicity, religion, sexual orientation and culture often intersect to create very different experiences and vulnerabilities in urban spaces and on transport systems (see box).

Intersectionality of identity and increased vulnerability to violence

The experiences of women in urban areas are not homogenous and, like all individuals, women and girls are simultaneously members of different groups in a society. In addition to their gender, all women are a member of a specific ethnicity, age group, sexual orientation and multiple other identities. Some of the groups which have been highlighted in the literature as particularly vulnerable to violence in urban spaces are:

- **Older women**: A WHO report into ‘age-friendly cities’ found that many older people are particularly fearful of going out at night in urban areas. Increased mobility challenges also mean that elderly women have greater difficulties accessing any services available to respond to violence and abuse.

- **Adolescent girls**: A Plan International study into adolescent girls' views on safety in cities found that whilst girls in urban areas are more likely to be educated and marry, they have to deal with regular threats to their safety. The research found that 40% of girls in Kampala never feel safe when walking in public spaces. 44% of girls in Cairo never feel safe on public transport. They are also often neglected in urban safety initiatives, which often prioritise young men, or women-specific safety initiatives which commonly focus on adult women and the domestic sphere.

- **Migrants**: A number of reports highlight the particular vulnerability of migrant women, including the rising number of women undertaking internal migration for work in cities and those who are particularly vulnerable due to their status as refugees or IDPs. A lack of economic opportunity or temporary or undocumented legal status can result in migrant women’s increased vulnerability to trafficking, sexual exploitation or abuse by employers and others in their community. In addition, undocumented migrants may be less likely to report violence for fear of repercussions and migrants may be less likely to have an awareness or confidence in the law.

---

22 Dominguez Gonzalez (2016)
23 Fia Foundation (2016)
25 WHO (2007)
26 Crockett et al (2016)
27 Travers et al (2013)
28 Human Rights Center, University of California (2013)
• **Sexual minorities:** Globally, lesbian, gay, bisexual, and transgender (LGBT) women face a disproportionate amount of violence, including police officers. Violence and discrimination can also have significant economic consequences on livelihoods and access to work.\(^{30}\)

• **Ethnicity/caste:** Ethnicity, caste or class are all social identities and divisions, which result in social relations that make minority women, or those who are regarded as of a lower status, more vulnerable to acts of violence. A scoping study into gender based violence in Skopje in Macedonia found that minority Albanian women use space differently and have different experiences of violence, including for example a high level of gender based violence incidents in schools.\(^{31}\) They also face a high degree of verbal violence whilst accessing public services.

• **Women with disabilities:** Evidence shows that women with disabilities in general face more physical, sexual and emotional violence than those without.\(^{32}\) For instance, a survey of 475 women with disabilities above the age of 16 in Nepal found that 58% of women reported they had ever experienced violence, including emotional violence (55%); physical violence (34%); and sexual violence (22%). These rates were significantly above the rates of violence (14% physical and 4.5% sexual) recorded amongst all women age 16-49 in the 2011 DHS.\(^{33}\)

Certain female-dominated urban livelihoods also carry a higher risk of violence than others, typically those which are largely invisible, informal and ignored by authorities.\(^{34}\) High risk groups include migrant workers, domestic workers, health services workers, and sex workers.\(^{35}\) The intersections of many of these groups (for example female migrant workers commonly work as domestic workers) are also important to consider.

**Better planning of urbanisation and infrastructure has the potential to create safe, inclusive and well-planned public spaces, urban services, transport and ‘last mile connectivity’,** which can reduce the violence and harassment that women and girls face and increase access to economic opportunities. There are various examples of promising practice for addressing VAWG in urban and infrastructure programmes, including UN Women’s *Safe Cities* and Safe Public Spaces programmes (see Section 2.2 on safe cities and Annex 3).

**Growing urbanisation can increase patterns, risks and types of violence, but can also present opportunities for women and girls.** The process of urbanisation is often associated with ‘risk’ and ‘vulnerability’ for women, but migration to urban areas can also be a way for women and girls to escape abuse and violence, as well as avail new opportunities. Cities can provide access to economic resources and institutional support to women experiencing violence.\(^{37}\)

---

30 Crehan and McCleary-Sills (2015)
32 Bell (2017)
33 Ministry of Health and Population (MOHP) [Nepal], New ERA, and ICF International Inc. (2012)
34 Kabeer (2014)
35 Fraser and Mohun (2016)
36 Last mile connectivity is about addressing safety, para transit and public space around major transport hubs like bus stops, bus terminals and metro stations (see Section 2.3).
37 Tacoli and Satterthwaite (2013); McIlwaine (2013)
Living in urban areas can also open up or change wider gender norms “in ways that can be emancipatory or that can consolidate existing gender inequalities”. Several studies have found a slow, but incremental, relaxing of gender norms in cities, as men and women assume new responsibilities. For example, a large World Bank study on gender equality, norms and agency, involving over 4,000 people in 20 countries, found that urban communities are often ahead of rural communities in norm relaxation and negotiation. However, this change was patchy; advances in some areas of norm change led to backlash in others. Urban focus groups highlighted how the stressful conditions bought on by higher costs of city living and unemployment often fuels domestic violence.

Construction projects, particularly of major transport and energy infrastructure, represent high risk environments for VAWG. A substantial influx of workers into a community area can increase risks of sexual exploitation, abuse and harassment to women and girls living in the project-affected areas and nearby communities, such as those providing services (e.g. traders, sex workers). There are also potential increased risks for women working in infrastructure construction, a traditionally male work environment.

Context is also important. Urban and infrastructure development in unstable, and post conflict/humanitarian situations give rise to particular challenges, including displacement, urban violence, armed conflict, trafficking and slavery. There is also still not enough attention paid to the unique vulnerabilities of displaced women and girls in urban areas, in camps (that often become semi-permanent), and related practice in infrastructure/service provision that will either serve to increase or reduce the risk of violence. The Inter-Agency Standing Committee (IASC) Guidelines for Gender-Based Violence Interventions in Humanitarian Settings provide useful guidance in this area.

1.4 What is the economic case for tackling VAWG in urban and infrastructure programmes?

Infrastructure and cities programming provides critical opportunities to boost economic growth. However, this growth can be undermined by the significant economic costs of violence against women and girls. Violence can have both direct and indirect costs and losses on the well-being of individuals, families and

---

40 USAID (2015)
41 International Rescue Committee (2017); Lee (2016)
42 Including guidance on: water; sanitation and hygiene; housing, land and property; shelter, settlement and recovery; livelihoods; camp coordination and management, amongst other thematic areas
communities, on businesses, economies, social and economic development, and political stability.  

The cost of violence against women ranges from 1.4% to 3.7% of Gross Domestic Product (GDP), according to recent costing studies within developing country contexts. The significance of this cost is highlighted in the table below, as a comparison with education expenditure as a percentage of GDP.

Cost of VAWG: summary table of selected findings for developing countries

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Cost Estimate</th>
<th>Percent of GDP</th>
<th>Primary Education as Percent of GDP</th>
<th>Secondary Education as Percent of GDP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ICRW (2009)</td>
<td>Uganda, Morocco</td>
<td>USD$5, USD$157</td>
<td>1.6, 6.5</td>
<td>18.0, 0.76</td>
<td>2.02, 2.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CARE (2010)</td>
<td>Bangladesh</td>
<td>USD$18 billion</td>
<td>2.05</td>
<td>0.96</td>
<td>0.98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Duvvury et al. (2012)</td>
<td>Viet Nam</td>
<td>USD$17.1 billion (out-of-pocket); USD$2.26 billion (productivity loss)</td>
<td>141.178</td>
<td>2.01</td>
<td>2.39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vara Horna (2014)</td>
<td>Peru</td>
<td>USD$17.1 billion (out-of-pocket); USD$2.26 billion (productivity loss)</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>1.26</td>
<td>0.93</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1. The ICRW study did not incorporate the macroeconomic costs and therefore estimated the costs as the proportion of per capita gross national income.
2. Refer to 2008 due to availability of data.

To date, few studies have looked specifically at the economic costs to urban areas or to infrastructure – a gap in the evidence (see box below for other gaps). Instead, most of the evidence base in middle and low-income countries focuses on the costs at the national level, with a focus on understanding the impact on work and productivity. In high-income countries, studies have focused more on establishing expenditure (e.g. service provision).
SECTION 2: SUGGESTED ENTRY POINTS

2.1 Introduction

DFID’s infrastructure and cities programming aims to provide economic growth that benefits the poorest and most marginalised in society. To this end, ICED has developed a Gender and Inclusion strategy with seven priority entry points for transformation\(^{46}\) to choose from depending on the ambition and programmatic approach.

This section identifies the risks of violence against women and girls in each of these entry points, as well as some opportunities and promising practices. It includes case studies from DFID’s portfolio, as well as wider examples of initiatives with potential for scale-up and transformation. Each sub-section is intended to work as a standalone short briefing note (e.g. VAWG and Energy), as well as helping to feed into later knowledge series for other thematic pieces. An additional section on construction is provided, covering the specific set of risks and mitigating interventions which apply during the construction period and cut across all seven entry points (see Section 2.9).

Some opportunities and promising practices are more easily implementable and cost-effective (‘quick wins’). Others are more difficult and costly, but potentially have the most transformative impact. ICED’s framework for gender and inclusion acknowledges that not all DFID urban and infrastructure programmes can be

---

\(^{46}\) The entry points align with the New Urban Agenda as well as DFID priority areas for infrastructure programming

\(^{47}\) ICED’s (2016) Gender and Inclusion strategy
transformational, but they do need to comply with DFID’s policy priorities on responding to the needs and vulnerabilities of marginalised groups (see Section 3). The table below summarises the risks and opportunities for each entry point. It highlights in blue the opportunities which could be considered to be first priority actions that meet DFID’s minimum level of ambition.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Safe space &amp; security</th>
<th>Risks of VAWG</th>
<th>Opportunities: integrating VAWG into urban/infrastructure programming</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Harassment and violence in public spaces, e.g. secluded areas such as narrow lanes, open empty spaces like parks and fields, public sanitation facilities (toilets/water points), and around drinking bars or where drug dealing takes place</td>
<td>Safety audits (e.g. Safetipin) to help urban planning and design in preventing VAWG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Improve reporting and multi-sectoral response</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Communications campaigns</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Training to help develop the knowledge and skills of police to respond to VAWG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Engaging men and boys to change social norms</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Address the links between VAWG and wider urban violence e.g. drug trade</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transport</td>
<td>As passengers on public transport and walking to and from transport hubs</td>
<td>Improve safety at and around transport hubs, including bus stops (‘last mile connectivity’)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>As transport workers (e.g. bus drivers, conductors)</td>
<td>Plan road crossing with VAWG in mind, e.g. open truss bridges and not underpasses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>During construction of transport infrastructure projects</td>
<td>Ensuring safeguards are in place for infrastructure construction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dangers of poorly designed underpasses – alone or with children</td>
<td>Use transportation infrastructure to raise awareness and address VAWG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Female-only transport</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Training transport workers to be more gender-sensitive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Working with transport workers to report trafficking and sexual exploitation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Water and sanitation</td>
<td>While using and travelling to/from water and sanitary facilities, or openly defecating</td>
<td>Work with communities – men and women - to prevent and respond to VAWG in WASH provision</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Violence when women and children have to queue for extended time periods</td>
<td>Female attendants for female-only latrines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Children can be vulnerable to violence when their mother leaves them to use WASH facilities</td>
<td>Involving vulnerable women in decision-making on the siting, design and management of facilities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Violence against women working in the WASH sector</td>
<td>Advocacy and communications</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Women’s WASH groups or platforms to discuss and propose strategies to reduce violence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Training and building the capacity of programme staff</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Policies, strategies and codes of conduct that ensure prevention of VAWG is incorporated into WASH provision</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Energy</td>
<td>Poorly lit streets</td>
<td>Improve street lighting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Electricity/power failures</td>
<td>Improved access to / provision of solar lamps</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lack of working public telephones</td>
<td>Improve community electrification and increase access to affordable electricity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Violence against women working in the energy sector</td>
<td>Support access to energy for women entrepreneurs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>During major energy infrastructure projects</td>
<td>Major energy programmes work with local women’s groups to identify opportunities to prevent and respond to VAWG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Land &amp; housing rights</td>
<td>Land &amp; housing rights</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Insecure dwellings</td>
<td>Insecure dwellings</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overcrowding in the home</td>
<td>Overcrowding in the home</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evictions/displacement</td>
<td>Evictions/displacement</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of land/property ownership</td>
<td>Lack of land/property ownership</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discriminatory inheritance rights</td>
<td>Discriminatory inheritance rights</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emergency shelters for women escaping violence</td>
<td>Emergency shelters for women escaping violence</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Long-term housing options and asset security</td>
<td>Long-term housing options and asset security</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reform of discriminatory laws which deny a woman’s right to inherit and/or own land</td>
<td>Reform of discriminatory laws which deny a woman’s right to inherit and/or own land</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Formal workers</th>
<th>Formal workers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>High levels of vulnerability in export-processing industries, (e.g. garment factories)</td>
<td>High levels of vulnerability in export-processing industries, (e.g. garment factories)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work involving direct services to the public (e.g. health, retail and hospitality)</td>
<td>Work involving direct services to the public (e.g. health, retail and hospitality)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Night shift and evening workers (e.g. providing hotel/restaurant services)</td>
<td>Night shift and evening workers (e.g. providing hotel/restaurant services)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reporting and redressal mechanisms for formal workers</td>
<td>Reporting and redressal mechanisms for formal workers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Protective legal and policy frameworks to prevent and respond to violence and harassment in the workplace</td>
<td>Protective legal and policy frameworks to prevent and respond to violence and harassment in the workplace</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unions, collective action and social dialogue</td>
<td>Unions, collective action and social dialogue</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training and awareness raising</td>
<td>Training and awareness raising</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social norm change</td>
<td>Social norm change</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Informal workers</th>
<th>Informal workers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>High risk groups include domestic workers, sex workers, market traders and street hawkers</td>
<td>High risk groups include domestic workers, sex workers, market traders and street hawkers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intersection with migration, trafficking and informal work</td>
<td>Intersection with migration, trafficking and informal work</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legal support to survivors of violence in the informal economy</td>
<td>Legal support to survivors of violence in the informal economy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Policy and legislative reforms</td>
<td>Policy and legislative reforms</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Awareness-raising and advocacy</td>
<td>Awareness-raising and advocacy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Providing safe workspaces for women in the informal economy</td>
<td>Providing safe workspaces for women in the informal economy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Targeted multi-component programmes for particular sectors (e.g. sex work)</td>
<td>Targeted multi-component programmes for particular sectors (e.g. sex work)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Construction</th>
<th>Construction</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>An influx of predominantly male workers can expose women and girls in the community to risks of sexual exploitation and violence.</td>
<td>An influx of predominantly male workers can expose women and girls in the community to risks of sexual exploitation and violence.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sex work and increased use of drugs and alcohol can further exacerbate the risk of VAWG.</td>
<td>Sex work and increased use of drugs and alcohol can further exacerbate the risk of VAWG.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women construction workers are vulnerable to sexual harassment and abuse</td>
<td>Women construction workers are vulnerable to sexual harassment and abuse</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Modern slavery and human trafficking</td>
<td>Modern slavery and human trafficking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ensuring social safeguards are in place including sexual harassment policies, procedures and reporting mechanisms to strengthen the duty of care across a range of actors</td>
<td>Ensuring social safeguards are in place including sexual harassment policies, procedures and reporting mechanisms to strengthen the duty of care across a range of actors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Empower women construction workers, and ensure they have a safe working environment, free from harassment and fear of violence</td>
<td>Empower women construction workers, and ensure they have a safe working environment, free from harassment and fear of violence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fair recruitment and building in an anti-trafficking prevention component</td>
<td>Fair recruitment and building in an anti-trafficking prevention component</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social norm change targeted at male construction workers</td>
<td>Social norm change targeted at male construction workers</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2.2 Safe space and security (with focus on public spaces)

What are the risks? Violence and harassment in public spaces reduce women and girls’ freedom of movement and their ability to participate in school, work and public life. It also limits their access to essential services, and enjoyment of cultural, recreational and political opportunities, as well as negatively impacting their health and wellbeing. Violence against women and girls, especially sexual harassment, in public spaces is increasingly being recognised a human rights violation that reduces the economic and social viability of cities.48

Where do women feel unsafe in urban areas?

Within urban settlements, there are particular locations where incidents of violence against women and girls are more likely to occur. Although analysis of individual urban areas reveals city-specific hotspots, common trends have been identified. In particular, violence is more likely to happen in public spaces such as public sanitation facilities, schools, water and food distribution sites, open spaces like parks and fields, secluded areas such as narrow lanes, and drinking bars or areas where a lot of drug dealing or consumption takes place.49 Sexual harassment as a form of VAWG is likely to take place on the streets, in public transport and at waiting spaces such as bus stops as evidenced in several studies.50 The use of public space is also intersected by time, and women are more likely to face violence at night in some of these areas, for instance whilst accessing public toilets.51 Further, all public spaces become more hostile for women after dark.

How to build gender-transformative safe spaces programmes? Various initiatives are being implemented either at a national or international level aimed at improving women and girls’ safety and mobility in public spaces, including UN Women’s global flagship programme, Safe Cities and Safe Public Spaces (2010-present).52 Evaluations of these safe spaces programmes have highlighted the need to build in sufficient resources and time to collect data on women’s safety and inclusion, particularly at baseline to inform programme design, but also to raise awareness among the public (see box).

A process evaluation53 of the Gender Inclusive Cities Programme in four cities around the world54, resulted in some interesting learning, such as programmes were more transformative when women’s groups were involved. For example, in Rosario, Argentina, the process of local women’s organisations mobilising around safe spaces led to the development of a Women’s Agenda for the City.55

48 UN Women (2014); Fulu (2016)
49 Fulu (2016); Tacoli, C. (2012)
50 WICI (2010)
51 UN Habitat (2013)
52 See Annex 2 for other safe cities programming and initiatives
53 WICI (2012)
54 Dar es Salaam (Tanzania), Delhi (India), Petrozavodsk (Russia), and Rosario (Argentina)
55 The Women’s Agenda consisted of a document articulating seven urgent demands by women in the city which related to care services for women that experience violence, citizen safety policies, awareness raising on women’s safety, and proposals for creating safer and friendlier neighbourhoods for everyone, but for women in particular
The agenda was presented at different city-wide events and used as an opportunity to have a dialogue with a range of stakeholders, including political candidates for the 2011 municipal election. The evaluation also noted the importance of reaching out to vulnerable populations, for example, in Rosario and Delhi, focus group discussions were held with transgendered persons and women street hawkers on safety and inclusion in cities.

Good practice on a transformational approach to VAWG in public spaces

Key recommendations from a recent comprehensive review of 55 evaluated interventions to enhance women and girls’ safety and mobility in public spaces in the Asia-Pacific region include:

- **Address sexual harassment against women in public spaces as part of the continuum of violence** against women and girls, from private to public and across the life-cycle.
- **Use research and develop an evidence base** to inform intervention design and implementation.
- **Ensure strong community engagement**, including participatory monitoring and evaluation frameworks. Link community programming to policy-level work.
- **Invest time and financial resources in coordination and partnership-building** throughout the life of a programme. Identify community champions in police, local governance agencies and corporations.
- **Develop and effectively implement comprehensive laws and policies** to prevent and respond to sexual violence in public spaces.
- **Ensure that gender-responsive budgets** are allocated.
- **Emphasise the training of service providers** and building their capacities.
- **Plan public spaces** for diverse activities and usage.

(Source: Fulu, 2016)

What are the key opportunities and promising practice for creating safe spaces and security for woman and girls?

**Safety audits** are popular participatory tools that have been used by diverse groups of women and girls to evaluate their city’s safety, generate rich local-level data about the relative safety of a place or area at different times in the day and at night, and to leverage women and girls’ knowledge to become voices of authority in their communities.56 Safety audits have been adapted in various settings and programmes. For example, Plan International developed a Girls’ Safety Walk tool as part of their ‘Because I am a Girl Urban Programme’. Adolescent girls used the tool in a familiar area of their city to help identify factors that make them feel safe and unsafe. In Kampala, 80% of girls reported feeling ‘very unsafe’ or ‘unsafe’ in public spaces, particularly when they were moving through the city – when walking and when using passenger taxis and motorcycles (boda-boda).57 As well as providing


57 Travers et al (2013). Boda Boda (motorcycle taxis) are a very important form of transport in Kampala but are particularly dangerous for women at night – particularly when used for journeys to slum areas.
data on safe and unsafe areas, the researchers also observed that as girls and boys used the tool, they were increasingly empowered to speak out and raise issues of safety and inclusion in their cities. (See Section 3.2 for more participatory methodologies and Section 3.6 for using new technologies for collecting user-generated data on safety)

**Improved reporting and multi-sectoral response systems for survivors,** covering safety, shelter, health, justice and other essential services, are an important part of ensuring cities are safe and secure for women and girls. For example, the Seoul Safe City Programme includes a one-stop system through which victims can report crimes and receive protection, including 24/7 hotlines, integrated one stop service centres, and legal and medical advisory groups. The city also put together a Sexual Violence Crisis Intervention Team, consisting of police officers, counsellors, medical and legal practitioners, to provide quicker emergency intervention and follow-up care for victims.\(^{58}\) Seoul has also developed innovative public-private partnerships around safe cities for women (see box).

**Communications campaigns** which combine mass media communication with on-the-ground education and outreach are a popular way of raising awareness, encouraging reporting and facilitating public dialogue around safe space and security. Activities include multi-media campaigns, street plays, art, television and radio shows and celebrity endorsements. More research is needed on the effectiveness of communications campaigns on changing social norms around VAWG as part of urban and infrastructure programming, although there does seem to be some early evidence about improved public awareness and increased

---

\(^{58}\) Fulu (2016)
dialogue.\textsuperscript{59} In New Delhi, India, Jagori had a campaign called “Staring Hurts” which aimed at raising awareness of supposedly less serious forms of sexual harassment such as staring. This included a short film which was shown on mainstream media.

**Police training** can help develop the knowledge and skills of police in urban areas and transport police to respond in an effective and appropriate way to violence against women. Research shows that harassment and violence, including from partners, often goes unreported, because women do not trust the police, feel that the experience will be humiliating or they will be blamed, that police officials will not do anything, or worse still, that they may be abused or assaulted by police. Perceptions of domestic violence being a ‘private family matter’ mean that women who report domestic violence to the police are often advised to reconcile their relationship.\textsuperscript{60} In Brazil, 84\% of women reported having been sexually harassed by the police.\textsuperscript{61} Police training can be a useful way of addressing these barriers to reporting.

**Engaging men and boys to change social norms on VAWG, including on intimate partner violence**, and as allies and active bystanders, can also help create safe and secure spaces. Strategies typically include group education, community outreach and mobilisation. There is an increasing international mandate for working with men and boys, with the second MenEngage Global Symposium\textsuperscript{62} producing a shared commitment, known as the *Delhi Declaration and Call to Action*, with a clear set of statements and affirmations that urge the full inclusion of men and boys in the struggle to achieve gender justice. For example, the award-winning *Bell Bajao* (Ring the Bell) cultural and media campaign in India\textsuperscript{63} seeks to reduce domestic violence by encouraging men to take a stand through small acts, such as ringing the doorbell to interrupt domestic violence when they hear it.

**Addressing the links between VAWG and wider urban violence**: For instance, research in Brazil has identified strong links between drug trafficking, related violence, a lack of policing and a decrease in women’s safety in urban areas.\textsuperscript{64} ICED recognises that VAWG is an important cross-cutting issue to consider across s

\textsuperscript{59} Fulu (2016)
\textsuperscript{60} Brickell (2014)
\textsuperscript{61} ActionAid (2016)
\textsuperscript{62} Held in New Delhi, India from November 10-13 2014.
\textsuperscript{63} ActionAid (2013) Women and the City II
\textsuperscript{64} ActionAid (2013) Women and the City II
The most common drivers of violence in urban humanitarian settings (see diagram) are at the structural and community levels, including economic strain and harmful gender norms, according to a recent systematic review by the International Rescue Committee.65

ActionAid’s safe cities programming sees women and girls as vulnerable to overlapping forms of violence – violence specifically targeting women in a continuum along the private and public sphere, and broader structural violence and insecurities as a result of poor urban planning.66

---

**Case study: Safe and Inclusive Cities programme**

DFID is working with Canada’s International Development Research Centre (IDRC) on the £4.5 million Safe and Inclusive Cities programme (2012-2017). The programme is supporting 15 different research teams to undertake research in 40 cities across 16 countries in sub-Saharan Africa, South Asia and Latin America. One research team looked at how infrastructure and services affect the manner in which women and men interact with each other, and how this can drive urban violence in working-class neighbourhoods in Karachi and Islamabad, Pakistan. In six of the seven neighbourhoods in Karachi, the team found that ‘water mafias’ are violently exploiting inadequate public water services and exacerbating the limited supply. Water shortages have led to heightened tensions and an increase in domestic violence, with men feeling humiliated by their inability to live up to their ideal of masculinity and provide for their family, and in turn lashing out at female relative for ‘wasteful’ practices.

(Source: Mahadevia et al, 2016)

---

**Key reading:**

Fulu, E (2016) A Regional Study of Interventions to Enhance Women and Girls’ Safety and Mobility in Public Spaces, Asia and the Pacific Region

Social Development Direct (2013) Making Cities and Urban Spaces Safer for Women: Safety Audit Participatory Toolkit (Developed on behalf of ActionAid International)

---

65 International Rescue Committee (2017)

66 Fulu (2016)
2.3 Transport

What are the risks? Women and girls face several risks of violence and sexual harassment relating to transportation and transport infrastructure:

- **As passengers on public transport and walking to and from transport hubs.** For example, a UN Women scoping report found that 90% of women in Port Moresby, Papua New Guinea, have experienced some form of sexual violence when accessing public transport.\(^{67}\)

- **As transport workers** (e.g. bus drivers, conductors). For example, harassment, molestation and abuse are daily occurrences for the 7,000 women bus conductors in the Indian state of Maharashtra. In an extreme case, one female conductor was brutally beaten and had her clothes torn off by a male passenger after she reprimanded him for using the wrong bus door in 2014.\(^{68}\)

- **Dangers of poorly designed dark underpasses**, alone or with children.

- **During construction of transport infrastructure projects.** (See Section 2.9)

What are the key opportunities and promising practice?

*Improving safety at and around transport hubs, including bus stops:* Safety on public transport includes the process of getting to and back from the transport hub. Women report that they face harassment not only inside public transport but also in the ‘last mile’ to and from the transport hub to their destination. This is often referred to as last mile connectivity. First mile and last mile refer to the first and last leg of a journey from home or any destination to and from a public transport stop.

Research shows that there are three elements of a journey:\(^{69}\):

1. walking to and from transport facilities,
2. waiting at the facility and
3. inside the transport.

Addressing safety and transit options at a transport waiting facility such as a bus stop or metro station is central to safety and improved mobility for women.\(^{70}\) Some of the factors that need to be taken into consideration are lighting, good walk path, and availability of safe and efficient para transit facilities such as bicycles, buses, rickshaws, taxis etc.\(^{71}\) Information about timings and schedules is also part of

---

\(^{67}\) UN Women (2014)  
\(^{68}\) Johari (2014)  
\(^{69}\) Fia Foundation (2016)  
\(^{70}\) Shah, S (2016)  
\(^{71}\) Safetipin (2016)
improved last mile connectivity.\textsuperscript{72} This information should be made available in a well-lit and inhabited area so that women are able to access it. Ensuring the presence of more women could be done through women taxi drivers, ticket collectors and women police in the areas outside transport hubs. Further, “eyes on the street” around these hubs is important and this can be achieved through small shops and vendors in and around the area.

**Use transportation infrastructure to raise awareness about VAWG.** Large numbers of passengers flow through a transport system every day, creating opportunities to advertise support services for survivors of violence (e.g. hotlines and reporting facilities), and display messaging to change norms and attitudes that perpetuate VAWG.\textsuperscript{73} For example, in Rosario, Argentina, public transport cards were printed with ‘No to Sexual Harassment’ slogan and telephone hotlines for reporting violence, as part of a Safe Cities campaign (see card above).\textsuperscript{74}

**Female-only transport** remains a contentious solution. Women-only public transportation schemes, such as female-only passenger cars on subways, local trains and women-only buses and taxis, may operate some or all of the time (e.g. during peak hours).\textsuperscript{75} The evidence remains mixed\textsuperscript{76} that female-only transport increases women’s mobility in settings where they regularly receive sexual harassment and assaults. Some women have expressed concerns about ‘pink trains’ in Sao Paulo, Brazil that they should feel safe in public, while in Bogota, Colombia, women reported that it was a superficial fix which did not address men’s behaviour.\textsuperscript{77} If temporary ‘quick win’ strategies are used that involve gender segregation, they should also be accompanied with long-term gender-transformative solutions aimed at changing norms around the acceptability of harassing women on public transport.\textsuperscript{78}

**Plan road crossings with VAWG in mind.** Poorly designed, dark underpasses and tunnels often cause fear for women and girls using them, who may feel trapped with no opportunity for escape. For example, during a safety audit in Cairo, girls identified a ring road that splits their community as the highest risk for their safety, both in

\textsuperscript{72} World Bank (2013)  
\textsuperscript{73} World Bank (2015)  
\textsuperscript{74} UN Women (2015a)  
\textsuperscript{75} Women-only cabins in public transportation have been used in many countries, including Brazil, India, Indonesia, Japan, Malaysia, Mexico, Nepal, Thailand, and the United Arab Emirates (World Bank, 2015)  
\textsuperscript{76} There are few evaluations assessing the impact of female-only transport. It has been reported that women-only cars in Mexico City’s Metro and bus systems helped reduce the number of sexual harassment cases from five to one per day (as part of a broader initiative). (Forde, 2013)  
\textsuperscript{77} Grant (2014) and Jaramillo (2014), cited in Gekoski et al (2015)  
\textsuperscript{78} Uteng (2011)
terms of traffic accidents crossing the road, but also the pedestrian tunnels that run under the road are poorly lit, long, have sewage floods, and are poorly maintained, putting girls at risk of sexual harassment when having to use them. Where possible, urban planners should design safe alternatives to underpasses (e.g. open truss bridges or safe road crossings), and ensure existing underpasses are well-lit.

**Training transport workers to be more gender-sensitive** For example, the ‘Building Bonds for Gender Sensitisation’ programme in New Delhi, India, provides training for drivers of auto-rickshaws, taxis and buses on keeping women safe. Over 145,000 drivers have been trained; almost 96% reported that the training was useful and have applied inputs from the trainings to their daily lives. The programme has been scaled up by the State Transport Department in New Delhi, who have made it mandatory for all auto rickshaw drivers at their annual vehicle check. Similarly, UN Women Morocco has developed a partnership with private bus company ALSA to integrate the issue of sexual violence prevention in the drivers’ training modules. Videos on sexual harassment are also regularly broadcast on the buses’ screens.

**Working with transport workers to report trafficking and sexual exploitation**
Transport workers on long-distance routes across international borders are in a unique position to help end trafficking by identifying and reporting any suspicious sightings. In the United States, the delivery-courier company UPS is currently training over 8,000 freight drivers to help them spot signs of trafficking between delivery nodes. In December 2016, a pilot programme was rolled out across ten US states where drivers received training and a wallet card with signs of trafficking, helpful phone numbers, and instructions on what to do if they spot trafficking. In Cambodia, ChildSafe International conducts a training course for taxi and tuk tuk drivers to identify potential cases of child trafficking and abuse. At the end of the training sessions, participating drivers must pass an examination and receive a certificate that they can show to passengers as a sign that they are not involved in the facilitation of prostitution or trafficking.

---

**Key reading:**

- International Transport Workers Federation (2013) *ITF Action Guide on Violence against Women*

---

79 Travers et al (2013)
80 Manas Foundation: [www.manas.org.in](http://www.manas.org.in); Fulu (2016)
81 UN Women (2015b)
83 ChildSafe International is a network of local and international people, businesses, and groups based in Cambodia to prevent child abuse. Drivers attend five training sessions where they develop practical skills to help them identify potential cases of child trafficking and abuse, e.g. if they were transporting young street children to brothels (Protection Project, 2012).
2.4 Water and sanitation

What are the risks? Women and girls face various risks of violence and sexual harassment around water and sanitation:

- While using and travelling to/from water and sanitary facilities, as well as when defecating in the open, particularly at night. For example, DFID-funded research in urban slums in Kampala, Uganda found that women were afraid of using toilets after nightfall due to what they perceived to be a high probability of attack and rape. The women reported that it was not uncommon for potential assailants to hide inside the latrines, particularly after dark.\(^{84}\) Similarly, 77% of women reported feeling unsafe using public toilets in urban slums in and around Lagos, Nigeria.\(^{85}\)

- Verbal and physical violence when women and children have to queue for extended time periods to use water or sanitation facilities, either in fights with other service users, or facing punishment for their late return home.\(^{86}\)

- Children can be vulnerable to violence when they are left at home or with relatives/neighbours while the mother leaves to collect water or undertake other tasks.\(^{87}\)

- Women working in the WASH sector may also be vulnerable to harassment, bullying and sexual exploitation during training and employment, in both the formal and informal economy. In Liberia, for example, girls who sell water from household-to-household are vulnerable to violence and there have been cases of girl water vendors being raped by householders.\(^{88}\)

How to build gender-transformative WASH programmes that address VAWG? DFID\(^{89}\) has produced a Practitioners Toolkit on Violence, Gender and WASH with ten principles which should be considered in WASH institutions and programmes. The principles vary by context and it is not expected that all actions will be undertaken in every WASH programme.

---

\(^{84}\) Massey (2011)  
\(^{85}\) Globescan Incorporated (2012)  
\(^{86}\) House (2013)  
\(^{87}\) SHARE Toolkit (2014)  
\(^{88}\) SHARE Toolkit (2014)  
\(^{89}\) The DFID-funded Sanitation and Hygiene Applied Research for Equity (SHARE) research programme consortium (with contributions from 27 organisations)
What are the key opportunities and promising practice?

Involving vulnerable women in decision-making on the siting, design and management of facilities: Location of public latrines can put women at risk of violence when travelling to the site.\textsuperscript{90} For instance, a study in Delhi found that women were afraid of attack or rape whilst travelling to, often distant WASH facilities after nightfall – a situation made worse by interruptions to electricity, both inside the communal facilities, and when travelling to them.\textsuperscript{91} Poor design of facilities can also exacerbate harassment or violence, such as a lack of roof on the toilet block, allowing boys and men to look inside when it is in use. To tackle this, small measures such as ensuring women and adolescent girls are involved in the decision process surrounding the design and siting of facilities is important. In some urban slum initiatives, water and sanitation facilities have been handed over to women to govern, manage, monitor and evaluate.\textsuperscript{92} In an alternative approach, NGO Force has been working with communities in Delhi to monitor and evaluate local toilets that were being poorly managed by subcontracted private firms, and women have been recording the maintenance, cleanliness and safety of toilets.\textsuperscript{93}

Female attendants for female-only latrines is a quick win for ensuring water and hygiene provision is designed and implemented in a gender-sensitive way. Gender-segregated toilets and washing facilities, with female attendants for female-only latrines and doors that lock from the inside, offers privacy and can help reduce the risk of violence for women and girls.\textsuperscript{94}

\textsuperscript{90} Massey (2011)
\textsuperscript{91} Women in Cities International, Jagori, International Development Research Centre (2011)
\textsuperscript{92} Lennon (2011)
\textsuperscript{93} Lennon (2011)
\textsuperscript{94} IASC (2015); Standing et al (2016)
Work with communities – men and women - to prevent and respond to VAWG in WASH provision at five key stages: (1) involve community in project initiation (e.g. assessment, analysis and design), particularly vulnerable groups of women and adolescent girls; (2) when carrying out training for WASH communities and/or small-scale service providers; (3) when carrying out monitoring and feedback at community level; (4) during group sessions, e.g. on menstrual hygiene management, HIV or gender; and (5) as stand-alone sessions as the need arises. It is also important to identify how the complex links between VAWG, water and sanitation relate to social and gender norms. For example, taboos around defecation and menstruation mean that women and girls may prefer to go to toilet/use bathing units in the dark. Similarly, local norms around masculinity may prevent boys and men who experience violence while accessing water and sanitation from reporting it.

Advocacy and communications are required to raise awareness around the connections between vulnerability to violence and WASH, and to tackle social taboos surrounding the issue. DFID’s Practitioners’ Toolkit urges targeted advocacy, directing particular messages to certain groups. A wide range of advocacy and communication methods have been used at the community level, including posters, postcards, billboards. Other key target groups for advocacy include: WASH sector professionals; specialists working on protection, gender, GBV, health and other areas; and governments and donors to promote prioritisation of water and sanitation in development plans and increase the availability of funds required to support training and additional resourcing.

Training and building the capacity of programme staff: DFID’s Practitioners’ Toolkit identifies a key responsibility for organisations working in the sector to be developing staff and partner capacity to understand issues related to WASH and violence and where their professional responsibilities lie. For instance, the Inter-Agency Standing Committee, which aims to improve coordination in humanitarian assistance, has included gender, VAWG and WASH recommendations into a number of its key training materials and handbooks documents. Training should also be provided to staff to cover context-specific vulnerabilities to violence, cultural norms, attitudes to topics such as menstruation, and behaviours which might result in violence.

Women’s WASH groups to discuss and propose strategies to reduce violence. For example, Oxfam introduced women’s WASH platforms in Bangladesh. Prior to the project, married women complained that in the dry season they could not bathe

---

95 SHARE Toolkit (2014)
96 Sommer et al (2014)
97 For instance, one key target group for advocacy are those within the local community – community leaders, school teachers, health professionals, religious leaders, and community groups, amongst others.
98 SHARE Toolkit (2014)
99 Ibid. For example, gender handbook incorporating standalone gender and WASH sheet, and gender training materials
and so regularly felt unclean and shy to sleep with their husbands, which in turn led to physical/mental abuse by husbands. The WASH platforms provided a safe space to discuss these issues, raise them with their husbands and community leaders, and resist violence when it occurs. Women also helped improve the design of WASH facilities to make them safer to use.¹⁰⁰

**Policies, strategies and codes of conduct that ensure prevention of VAWG is incorporated into WASH provision**, including enforcement mechanisms to avoid the sexual abuse and exploitation of beneficiaries. As an example of good policy practice, a draft strategic framework was developed in collaboration between a local authority, local NGO and international NGO to improve women’s safety in public spaces in Delhi.¹⁰¹ The framework includes WASH specific strategies, in addition to protection and legal aspects, and education and advocacy elements. Feeding into this, action research was undertaken by Jagori along with Women in Cities International in two sites in Delhi, aiming to address the ‘gender services gap’ and test out the Women’s Safety Audit Methodology, identifying issues and then developing a model for engaging women with their local government agencies and other providers.¹⁰² As a result, a new relationship formed between women, communities and sanitation workers, levels of harassment went down, and women designed a new community toilet complex addressing a number of key concerns.

A number of WASH programmes use a **Community Led Total Sanitation (CLTS) methodology**, which aims to mobilise communities to eliminate open defecation by conducting their own appraisals and leading the resulting action, focusing on behavioural change rather than toilet construction. For instance, Plan International Netherlands is implementing a Pan Africa CLTS programme in eight countries. The programme reports that in Ethiopia by the end of 2012 over a hundred neighbourhoods had safe sanitation and hygiene services and had reached open defecation free status.¹⁰³ One of the key benefits is that women are able to avoid open defecation at night and avoid the attached security risks and fear of violence.

---

**Key reading:**

SHARE (2014) [Violence, Gender and WASH: A Practitioners Toolkit](#)

---

¹⁰⁰ SHARE (2014)
¹⁰¹ UN-Habitat, Department of Women and Child Development, Government of the National Capital Territory of Delhi, Jagori, UN Women
¹⁰² Women in Cities International, Jagori and International Development Research Centre (2011)
2.5 Energy

What are the risks? Women and girls face various risks of violence and sexual harassment around access to energy:

- **Poorly lit streets** can increase women’s fear of being a victim of crime. In Delhi, India, a survey\(^{104}\) of over 2,000 women found that 63% of respondents felt fearful of going out after dark. More than 21% do not venture out alone at all. In Addis Ababa, Ethiopia, research by ActionAid\(^ {105}\) found that women vendors fear negotiating deserted roads, especially early in the morning or late at night when the roads are dark and poorly lit. These women workers lack access to a proper marketplace and sell their goods on the street so are at constant risk of robbery.

- **Electricity/power failures** can impede women and girls’ ability to access essential services safely. For example, a women’s safety audit\(^ {106}\) in Bawana, India found that during electricity cuts, women are at increased risk of being groped at community toilet complexes. As a result, many women try to control their urges to use the toilets until the electricity comes back on.

- **Lack of working public telephones or access to a private mobile phone** can make it difficult for women to call telephone hotlines to call for help or report violence.\(^ {107}\)

- **Violence and harassment against women working in the energy sector**, for example, with reports of women facing sexual harassment in Pakistan’s oil and gas industry and Bangladesh’s rural electric utilities.\(^ {108}\)

- **During the construction of major energy infrastructure projects**. An influx of migrant workers can create markets for sexual exploitation, abuse and human trafficking, as occurred for women living around the Baku-Tbilisi-Ceyhan oil pipeline project in Azerbaijan. Women and children are also at greater risk of domestic violence if men’s increased income is spent on alcohol, drugs, or prostitution.\(^ {109}\)

What are the key opportunities and promising practice? The evidence for what energy programmes can do to improve women’s safety and experiences of violence in urban areas remains at an early stage. Some strategies to prevent violence against women, such as distributing handheld solar lamps and fuel-efficient stoves,
have been mainly tried in camp-based rural settings with the exception of solar lamps in post-earthquake urban Haiti. Potential opportunities include:

**Improved street lighting** is often seen as a ‘quick win’ to improve women and girls’ sense of safety, which can in turn open up their access to social and economic opportunities in urban areas.\(^{110}\) Street lighting can have the effect of increasing the length of women’s days and their use of outside space, resulting in increases in economic activity.\(^{111}\) In India, the DFID-supported SafetiPin, a mobile app which collects data on women’s safety, has encouraged urban authorities to invest in improving street lighting in dangerous locations\(^{112}\) (see Section 3.5 for more on the use of digital technologies). However, improved street lighting implies significant involvement of local authorities, not just to install the lighting systems but also to ensure they are maintained and pay the supplier for the electricity used.\(^{113}\)

There have been several academic studies of the connection between light and crime, mainly in high-income countries, which have found mixed results. For example, systematic reviews of lighting experiments found that increased street lighting coincided with a drop in the affected areas’ crime rates in some cities, but not others.\(^{114}\) The researchers find little evidence that lighting works as a form of crime deterrence; rather street lights might be effective because they increase community pride and a sense of investment in the area, bring more people outside, and provide reassurance to people who were previously fearful in their use of public space after dark.

**Improved access to / provision of solar lamps** is most typically used in urban settings as part of humanitarian/emergency programmes, although there are some indications that there is considerable untapped need for solar lanterns in urban slum communities.\(^{115}\) To date, the best-studied urban intervention of solar lamp provision and links to women’s safety is post-earthquake Haiti. A rigorous evaluation was conducted in two camps for internally displaced persons in Port-au-Prince, involving control groups. 95% women and girls reported using the handheld solar lamps at least once a day and said they would recommend them to friends. However, women’s perceptions of their own safety remained the same or worsened after the lamps were distributed, due to broader security concerns that could not be solved by a stand-alone lamp distribution.\(^{116}\)

---

\(^{110}\) World Bank Energy Sector Management Assistance Program (2013)  
\(^{111}\) Rakodi and Lloyd-Jones (2002)  
\(^{112}\) ICAI (2016)  
\(^{113}\) It is most needed in slum areas, although public authorities often object on the grounds that service provision will legitimise an informal/illegal housing area.  
\(^{114}\) Farrington and Walsh (2002); Walsh and Farrington (2008)  
\(^{115}\) Bhalla (2014)  
\(^{116}\) IRC (2014)
Improved community electrification and increased access to affordable electricity may have spill-over impacts on reducing violence and harassment in the household and community. Studies of rural electrification have found that women in households with electricity report significantly lower acceptance of intimate partner violence. Researchers have theorised that access and higher exposure to information via television influences attitudes and behaviour around gender equality and violence against women. A study of rural electrification in Bangladesh found that almost everyone (98%), irrespective of access to household electricity, agreed that protective security has increased due to electrification. DFID’s Collaborative Research Group on Gender and Energy (2006) also observed that lighting and media could affect gender cooperation in the household and reduce violence.

Supporting access to energy/electricity for women entrepreneurs has the potential to protect women from intimate partner violence, by contributing significantly to female empowerment. Improved energy access, including to lighting, cooking, mobile phone charging, and refrigeration, can increase productive time for income-generating activities, and be a catalyst for women’s economic empowerment. Women’s increased economic income and activity can present both an opportunity to challenge and escape intimate partner violence, but also present a risk of increased violence from husbands, families or other community members where it challenges predominant social norms. It is therefore important that initiatives that aim to economically empower women, including through access to energy, integrate measures to address VAWG.

Major energy programmes work with local women’s groups to identify opportunities to prevent and respond to VAWG. Although at an early stage, there are a few examples of innovative projects (see box below).

### Case studies of mainstreaming VAWG into energy infrastructure programmes

**Poland:** The World Bank’s Poland Hard Coal Social Mitigation Project focused on the social effects of the restructuring of the coal industry on the community by training female community leaders. The women identified how the loss of jobs for male coal workers provoked depression, substance abuse, and domestic violence. As a result, a domestic violence safe house was established.

**Papua New Guinea:** Women identified domestic violence as the most negative impact of the mining industry during a series of national conferences held by the World Bank. In response, the mining companies established gender desks and hired staff to engage with local women’s associations. The World Bank also designed a follow up project that focused on women’s empowerment as a means to prevent domestic violence in mining and petroleum communities.

(Source: Willman and Corman, 2013)

---

117 Sievert (2015) based on Demographic and Health Survey data from rural areas in 22 Sub-Saharan countries.
118 Barkhat (2002)
119 Haves (2012)
120 O’Dell et al (2014)
121 Taylor et al (2015)
2.6 Land and housing rights

What are the risks? Women and girls are at increased risk of violence due to a set of related risk factors around land and housing rights:

- **Insecure dwellings in communities with high crime rates and few security patrols** can exacerbate women’s vulnerability to burglary, theft and rape in their own homes. Recent migrants are often particularly vulnerable to attacks from strangers and are less able to seek protection from neighbours.¹²²

- **Overcrowding in the home** and the ‘stress-inducing’ conditions associated with it can trigger intimate partner violence and domestic violence.¹²³ For example, research with indigenous Mexican women found that overcrowding, lack of privacy, and relations with the husband’s in-laws (who often live in the same household) were key factors exacerbating violence and family arguments.¹²⁴

- **Evictions/displacement as a result of urbanisation or infrastructure projects can increase violence and insecurity for women.** Women can be forced into precarious housing situations, having to compromise their safety and forced to adopt risky coping mechanisms.¹²⁵ For example, rapid urban development has led to hundreds of thousands of people being forcibly evicted from their homes in Rio, Brazil. These displacements have exposed women and girls to higher levels of violence, sexual abuse, exploitation of children and young people, and people trafficking.¹²⁶

- **Women’s lack of land and property ownership weakens their defence against domestic violence and keeps them in abusive relationships.¹²⁷** In Kerala, India, research shows that women who own land or a house (but especially the latter) are much less likely to experience violence. Women’s ownership of property is

¹²² Chant (2013)
¹²³ McIlwaine (2015)
¹²⁴ Peña et al (2014)
¹²⁵ Norwegian Refugee Council (2014)
¹²⁶ ActionAid (2014)
¹²⁷ Chant (2013); McIlwaine (2015)
seen as a ‘tangible exit option’, which strengthens women’s bargaining power in marriage, acting as a deterrent to marital violence.\textsuperscript{128} However, estimates show that women represent less than 15% of land and property owners worldwide.\textsuperscript{129}

- **Discriminatory inheritance rights** are a form of economic violence in itself, and can lead to threats and acts of violence if a woman refuses to leave her house. Widows and orphans are particularly at risk of ‘property grabbing’. The practice of early marriage means that young brides who marry older husbands are facing widowhood at an earlier age. At least 115 countries specifically recognize women’s property rights on equal terms to men, but this varies considerably by region (see diagram)\textsuperscript{130}.

**What are the key opportunities and promising practice?** Although there have been various studies highlighting the need for land and housing programmes to address women’s safety and experiences of violence in urban areas, the evidence base on interventions that work in low and middle-income countries remains limited. Some key opportunities include:

**Emergency shelters for women escaping violence** are designed to accommodate women and children while they consider their options, and make alternative arrangements. Some shelters limit the amount of time a woman can stay, while others do not. Shelters can provide food and clothing to women; coordinate the delivery of services to them; provide women with therapy and counselling; help women find employment and access healthcare; and even campaign on violence against women. Indeed, a number of studies have found that the more types of services women use while in shelter, the more likely they are to live independently post-shelter.\textsuperscript{131} Experts recommend that legislation should mandate a shelter/safe space for every 10,000 members of the population, which can accommodate survivors and their children for emergency stays, and which will help them to find a refuge for longer stays.\textsuperscript{132}

**Long-term housing options (mandated by law)** tend to be limited in most countries. However, there are a few examples of good practice. For example, in Slovenia, the Housing Act ensures that survivors of domestic violence are eligible for publicly funded or non-profit rented housing.\textsuperscript{133} Brazil, Cambodia, India and Serbia have enacted legislation which provides for the right of a victim of domestic violence

\textsuperscript{128} Panda and Agarwal (2005)
\textsuperscript{129} Chant (2013)
\textsuperscript{130} Source of diagram: UN Women (2011), p.39. UN Women calculated regional averages using women’s right to ownership and inheritance World Bank data from 124 countries. Even where women have constitutional guarantees of land rights, customary law can take precedence on issues of inheritance and marriage.
\textsuperscript{131} Jewkes (2014); Sullivan (2012)
\textsuperscript{132} See UN Handbook 3.6.1 and UN Women guidance on shelter
\textsuperscript{133} UN Women (2015a)
to remain in the family home and for the perpetrator to be removed.\textsuperscript{134} While legislation is important, it needs to be accompanied by consistent and adequate funding to be effective. In Mongolia, for example, the domestic violence legislation refers in several places to placing domestic violence survivors in shelters, but there is only one shelter in the country.\textsuperscript{135}

**Reform of discriminatory laws** which deny a woman’s right to inherit and/or own land and other property is also important for reducing women’s vulnerability to violence.

**Case study: Reform of discriminatory land/housing laws, Rwanda**

Rwanda began an ambitious land tenure reform programme in 2004, which aimed to increase tenure security for all landowners and, in particular, eliminate discrimination in the case of women. New legal, regulatory and institutional frameworks were established, and a land registration process was implemented that aimed to be participatory and community led. Legally, the reforms enabled women to deal in and inherit land, and provided protection for their rights through the deed. Legally married couples are now both required to be present when registering land, to ensure that they are registered as joint property owners, allowing women equal rights. Reform of land registration also affected inheritance, requiring both male and female children to be registered as individuals with a beneficial interest in their parents’ land. Following the revisions to the law, UN Women have supported 15,000 women to register to inherit and own land and property.

(Source: UN Women, 2013b)

**Key reading:**

UN OHCHR (2014) *Women and the Right to Adequate Housing* (pages 74-81)

\[\textsuperscript{134} \text{UN Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights (2014)}\]

\[\textsuperscript{135} \text{The Advocates for Human Right / National Center Against Violence (2013)}\]
2.7 Formal workers

What are the risks? Women engaged in formal work face various risks of violence and sexual harassment at work and on their way to and from their place of work. The types of violence that women experience vary by the sectoral composition of the local urban economy. Although women are engaged in a diverse range of roles in the formal economy worldwide, most research/programming on violence against female formal workers has focused on export-processing industries, particularly in garment factories in South Asia and maquilas in Mexico and Central America. Where a city’s growth is largely dependent on export-oriented manufacturing and employs a lot of women, a marked increase in violence against women often occurs, both in households and in the public sphere. There are complex reasons for this phenomenon, but studies have identified a male backlash against women’s status as preferred workers and their greater independence, together with resentment that they appear to be transgressing the boundaries of ‘acceptable womanhood’.¹³⁶

Women employed in sectors involving direct services to the public, and particularly female-dominated sectors such as health, retail and hospitality, are also at high risk of client-initiated violence.¹³⁷ For example, a study on the prevalence of workplace violence in Rwanda’s health sector found that 39% of health workers had experienced some form of workplace violence in the year prior to the study. Sexual harassment was a particular problem for female health workers (75% had been sexually harassed at work), and formed part of a wider workplace culture of gender discrimination.¹³⁸ Night shift and evening workers (e.g. providing hotel/restaurant services) are a group at high risk when working or travelling to/from work late at night, particularly when alone.

What are the key opportunities and promising practice? The workplace has been identified¹³⁹ as a good entry point for developing scalable solutions to ending violence against women and girls. Some key opportunities include:

Reporting and redressal mechanisms: Ending impunity requires adequate mechanisms for redressal of complaints, prosecution and punishment of perpetrators, coupled with workplace-level policies and implementation strategies.

¹³⁶ McIlwaine (2015)
¹³⁷ VicHealth (2012)
¹³⁸ Newman et al (2011)
¹³⁹ Fulu and Kerr-Wilson, 2015; Fulu et al, 2014, as part of the DFID-funded global evidence review of the literature on ‘What Works to Prevent Violence against Women and Girls?’
For example, as part of the Preventing Workplace Violence project\textsuperscript{140}, a series of measures have been introduced into garment factories in India and Bangladesh: training courses to senior managers and workers; anti-harassment helplines; and sexual harassment committees to file grievances on behalf of garment workers who have experienced harassment or abuse. Initial results show that the election of anti-harassment committees has helped improve dialogue between workers and managers.\textsuperscript{141}

**Protective legal and policy frameworks** for addressing harassment and violence in the workplace are important, although poor enforcement of legislation is an on-going challenge. In addition, women working in informal arrangements, such as domestic workers, are often unprotected by legislation. In Pakistan, the Protection against Harassment of Women at Workplace Bill\textsuperscript{142} was signed in 2010, after many years of campaigning by women activists and civil society organisations. It clearly outlines procedures for inquiries and penalties, ranging from mild reprimands to firing the accused. The accompanying Code of Conduct should be displayed in all government departments and private companies.

**Unions, collective action and social dialogue:** At the sector level or company/workplace level, employee representatives have been involved in strategies aimed at addressing VAWG from policy design to conducting training, administering complaints procedures, running self-defence courses for women, organising public events, and monitoring results.\textsuperscript{143} In Kenya, for example, Mombasa port workers in the Dock Workers’ Union campaigned on gender sensitisation, child abuse and women’s rights protection, which has opened up job opportunities for women in a male-dominated workplace and ‘dramatically decreased’ VAWG in the workplace.\textsuperscript{144}

**Training and awareness-raising** can be targeted at particular individuals (managers, counsellors) or directed at the entire workforce. Training often focuses on raising general awareness on VAWG, as well as outlining the details of applicable policy/legislation, managers’ responsibilities, and the details of the grievance/reporting procedures.\textsuperscript{145} It can also include a wide variety of awareness-raising activities in the workplace and wider community (see box below).

\textsuperscript{140} An innovative partnership between Indian and Bangladeshi garment factories, European clothing brands, governments, civil society organisations and trade unions in Europe and Asia

\textsuperscript{141} FWW (2013)

\textsuperscript{142} The law identifies 3 manifestations of sexual harassment in the workplace: abuse of authority; creating a hostile environment; and retaliation after an employee refuses to grant sexual favours (Taylor, 2015)

\textsuperscript{143} Taylor (2015); McGann (2005)

\textsuperscript{144} ITF (2013). No publically available statistics on how much VAWG has decreased by.

\textsuperscript{145} McGann (2005)
Cambodia: Safe Workplaces, Safe Communities

Funded by the UN Trust Fund to End VAW and implemented by CARE, this project aims to reduce violence and sexual harassment in workplaces.

It works specifically with women garment factory workers and women working in the tourism and hospitality sectors. CARE helped set up Cambodia’s Solidarity Association of Beer promoters to combat violence and harassment in beer gardens and karaoke bars where women are employed as hostesses, waitresses or beer promoters. Project activities include providing training to 750 workers each year and peer education on VAWG and sexual harassment.

The project is also training employers on Cambodian labour law, policies, gender and women’s rights, as well as judicial police officers and committee officials. During 2014, over 3,000 female workers were actively engaged in peer support networks. As part of the project, garment workers wrote a “Sexual Harassment Stops Here!” karaoke song with lyrics include women’s descriptions of what it means to feel safe from violence.

(Source: CARE Cambodia, 2014)

Social norm change Social norms affect how people behave in the workplace, what roles people play, and what is / is not acceptable behaviour, including around violence. There have been a few examples of programmes that have used a ‘whole company approach’ with internal champions and links to the wider community to shift social norms around VAWG. Social norm change often involves reaching a ‘tipping point’ within a particular community, or in this case a workplace, and there is some early research to suggest that making the economic case for addressing VAWG within an organisation (e.g. on productivity and profitability) can help build a critical mass of supporters within an organisation to tackle violence.146 DFID is currently funding an innovative project under the What Works to Prevent VAWG flagship global research programme147 aimed at ending violence against women and girls in five garment factories in Dhaka (see box).

146 Taylor (2015)
147 The programme is led by BSR (Business for Social Responsibility) in partnership with Change Associates, the Awaj Foundation and the International Labour Organization’s Better Work programme.
DFID’s innovative ‘HERrespect’ project uses the workplace as a context for dialogue between men and women to tackle underlying issues that drive violence against women and girls.

It provides training to workers and factory managers to address issues around gender equality in the workplace. HERrespect is being piloted in four garment factories in Bangladesh. In 2017 the program will be expanded to India, where a toolkit will be published to help factories understand the benefits and methodology of HERrespect.

The program aims to reduce violence against women and promote more gender equitable attitudes and relationships amongst women and men by: training middle management and female and male workers on gender awareness and interpersonal skills to prevent and address sexual harassment and intimate partner violence. To date, HERrespect has seen men and women challenging assumptions and beliefs about gender in the workplace and in the community more widely.

(Photo: HERrespect participants in Bangladesh. Credit: Leane Ramsoomar-Hariparsaad, PhD)

Key reading:
McCann, D (2005) Sexual Harassment at Work: National and international responses
ILO (2017) Resource Kit on Gender-Based Violence in Global Supply Chains
DFID (2015) Addressing VAWG through Women’s Economic Empowerment Programmes
2.8 Informal workers

What are the risks? Women are overrepresented in low skilled, insecure or temporary, low paid work in the informal economy which can leave them vulnerable to abuse and discrimination. The flexible and insecure nature of many sectors that women work in, as well as the stigma attached to reporting violence and harassment at work, means that many studies cite the difficulty in gathering reliable data of such violence.\textsuperscript{148}

High risk groups of female informal workers include:

- **Market traders and vendors**: For example, a study of young female hawkers from six motor-parks in south-western Nigeria found about a quarter had experienced attempted rape while about one in 20 had been raped.\textsuperscript{149}

- **Cross-border traders** are also at great risk of violence, particularly in fragile and conflict-affected states. A study of women traders in the Great Lakes region (DRC, Burundi, Rwanda and Uganda) found that over half (54\%) had experienced acts of violence, threats and sexual harassment.\textsuperscript{150}

- **Home-based workers** who are vulnerable to domestic violence, exploitation by middle-men and illegal seizures of assets.\textsuperscript{151}

- **Waste pickers**: For example, women waste pickers in Cape Town, South Africa are vulnerable to sexual harassment, rape, having to work with their children in unsafe conditions because childcare is unaffordable, verbal abuse (being called a ‘mad woman’), and gender-based discrimination from local officials.\textsuperscript{152}

- **Domestic workers**: In Brazil, a study found 26\% of female domestic workers had been sexually harassed at work during the past year. Live-in workers were at significantly greater risk for experiencing sexual harassment than those residing in their own homes.\textsuperscript{153}

- **Sex workers**: For example, in Dhaka, Bangladesh, a survey of 540 female sex workers found that 49\% had been raped and 59\% beaten by police in the last year.\textsuperscript{154}

The intersection of migration and trafficking with informal work is associated with higher risks of violence against women and girls. In destination countries,

\textsuperscript{148} Fraser and Mohun (2016)
\textsuperscript{149} Fawole et al. (2002)
\textsuperscript{150} Brenton (2011)
\textsuperscript{151} Doane (2007)
\textsuperscript{152} Findings from a social mapping exercise facilitated by WIEGO in partnership with the International Labour Research and Information Group (ILRIG) (Pillay, 2015)
\textsuperscript{153} DeSouza and Cerqueira (2008)
\textsuperscript{154} Chant and McIwaine (2016)
women are often offered jobs in sectors that are more at-risk since they tend to be “invisible” and often isolated, such as domestic work or sex work.\textsuperscript{155} For example, an ODI study on Ethiopian migrant domestic workers in the Middle East found that many experience physical abuse (largely from female employers) and sexual harassment and violence (mainly from male employers).\textsuperscript{156}

**What are the key opportunities and promising practice?** The nature of informal and sometimes invisible economies, mean that the women in such lines of work can be difficult to reach and intervention programmes and support services are often targeted at particular sectors (e.g. domestic work, sex work, market trading).\textsuperscript{157} For many women, the line between ‘work’ and ‘home’ is also blurred, as women workers in factories and on agricultural plantations often work and live on the same site. These ‘fluid’, ‘flexible’ workspaces pose additional challenges for interventions aiming to reduce violence against informal workers.\textsuperscript{158}

**Legal and social support for survivors of violence** Informal workers are often reluctant to report violence and seek legal help, due to their vulnerability and sometimes the illegality of their status. Several interventions have trained paralegals\textsuperscript{159} and women’s legal rights organisations to increase access to justice for marginalised women working in the informal economy by raising awareness about women’s rights, reporting and referral mechanisms, and providing advice and support to help women navigate legal processes (see box).

---

**Case Study: ‘Give Payment, Not Abuse’ protecting informal women traders in Dar es Salaam from violence against women**

The UN Trust Fund to End Violence against Women (which DFID currently contributes up to £8m) is funding a project based in six markets in Dar es Salaam, Tanzania. The project aims to ensure that women market traders can work without fear of violence and are protected by law. As part of the project, Equality for Growth, a local women’s organization, have trained forty women vendors to become paralegals and legal community supporters. The women raise awareness about women’s rights, violence and referral services. In 2016, they assisted 454 women to report cases of violence against them in the markets. The project has also created new guidelines to end violence against women, agreed with market officials, vendors and the police, which are being implemented in all six markets. A recent survey found nearly 2 in 3 women know where to report violence, and 4 in 5 women say that violence has decreased in the markets.

(Source: UN Women, 2017)

---

**Policy and legislative reforms** Women working in informal and often unregulated environment often do not enjoy the protection of the law, either because their work

---

\textsuperscript{155} ILO (2008)  
\textsuperscript{156} Jones et al (2014)  
\textsuperscript{157} Taylor (2015)  
\textsuperscript{158} Fraser and Mohun (2016)  
\textsuperscript{159} Paralegals are trained to perform legal work and procedures, but are not qualified lawyers.
environments are outside the reach of the law, or because the law is not enforced.\textsuperscript{160} The **International Labour Organization’s global convention on domestic work** (Convention 189), finalised in 2011, is important, but to date has only been ratified in 23 countries. An example of protective municipal reform is the **2014 Street Vendors (Protection of Livelihood and Regulation of Street Vending) Act**, introduced in India after sustained advocacy by the Self-Employed Women’s Association (SEWA) and other smaller organisations. The act mandates the engagement of street vendors in local and municipal planning in India, to ensure their needs are considered and protect them harassment.\textsuperscript{161}

**Awareness-raising and advocacy** about issues of violence, labour exploitation, sexual abuse and violence faced by women in the informal economy is an important step in ensuring that women workers are aware of their rights and know how to report violence. Women working in the informal economy are increasingly advocating for change by organising into larger organisations at the local, national and global levels, for example through the **International Federation of Domestic Workers** and **Women in Informal Employment (WIEGO)**. By organising collectively, women who are located on the invisible margins of urban informal economies can have a voice to most marginalised workers.\textsuperscript{162}

**Providing safe workspaces for Informal workers:** There is generally inadequate investment in markets. Some researchers have found that women traders prefer markets even in peripheral locations because of their great safety.\textsuperscript{163} Limited formal market space increased VAWG risks through:

- Women being forced to trade in isolated/exposed/unsafe places because no formal space available, and
- Exploitation by corrupt/unscrupulous officials who demand sexual favours in exchange for a market trading pitch.

Well planned markets on the other hand provide opportunities to include physical facilities such as segregated toilets, and possibly arrangements such as care facilities that meet the needs of women with children.

However, there is a risk to the poorest informal traders that once formal markets are opened they will be driven off the streets by the police, and forced to find even more marginal and vulnerable locations.

\textsuperscript{160} UN Secretary-General’s **UNITE to End Violence against Women** campaign (2014)
\textsuperscript{161} UN Women (2015c)
\textsuperscript{162} Kabeer et al (2013)
\textsuperscript{163} University of Westminster for Cities Alliance (2016)
Street trade is one of the most important urban livelihoods for women, particularly in the cities of West Africa, South East Asia and Latin America, but female traders often face harassment, violence and unsafe working environments. An example of an initiative aimed at creating safe, clean and inclusive public markets, which reduce fear and violence against women and girls is the Port Moresby Safe City Programme (see box).

**Port Moresby, Papua New Guinea: Making markets safer for women vendors**

Over half (55%) of women experienced some form of sexual violence in market spaces in the previous year, according to a 2011 scoping study which also found that the local population were not going to markets and there was virtually no tourism in the markets due to safety concerns.

In Geheru market (one of the first markets to be upgraded), there have been a number of improvements: safer bathrooms and showers; new innovative cashless methods for collection of fees to prevent extortion and theft; and a referral system for survivors of family and sexual violence in the markets. UN Women have produced a short film on the lessons from the initiative.

Although there has been no official assessment of whether violence has decreased as a result of the initiative, female vendors say it has made an ‘enormous difference’, and the New Zealand Government invested a further US$6.1 million to roll out the programme to a second market site – Gordons Market, the capital city’s busiest, and also the largest market in the Pacific region.

(Source: UN Women, 2014; Kelly, 2016)

**Targeted multi-component programmes for particular sectors (e.g. sex work)**

Sex workers face different types of violence – on the streets, on the job, or in their personal lives – and from a range of perpetrators. Sex work is highly stigmatized and in most countries, sex work is either illegal or has an ambiguous legal status. A number of programmes have developed ways to reduce violence faced by sex workers. As part of DFID’s What Works to Prevent VAWG global research programme (2013-2018), the UK is funding Samvedana Plus, an intervention and evaluation study in Bagalkot district, India to reduce violence in the intimate partnerships of female sex workers. The intervention provides individual and couple counselling to sex workers and their partners, strengthens sex worker collectives, and aims to shift social norms and prevent violence through community level action.

---

164 Mariotti and Bridonneau (2016)
165 Jointly implemented by UN Women and the National Capital District Commission (NCDC), the project is also supported by the New Zealand Aid Programme, the Government of Spain and the Australian Aid Programme
166 Including: raising awareness of rights; developing educational materials providing safety tips; organizing and mobilizing sex workers to fight violence; warning systems to inform sex workers of potentially violent clients; training and sensitisation with law enforcement officials; advocating for legal and police reforms; creating safe spaces (‘drop in’ centres); and providing health services to sex workers who experience violence.
Construction

What are the risks? Women and girls face various risks of violence and sexual harassment during the implementation of construction projects:

- **Women construction workers are vulnerable to sexual harassment and abuse**, exacerbated by the traditionally male working environment. For example, female construction workers in Sylhet city, Bangladesh have described being economically exploited, verbally abused, and sexually harassed, mostly by co-workers or construction supervisors.\(^{167}\)

- **Large construction projects which involve an influx of predominantly male workers** into a community area can expose women and girls living in the community and providing services (e.g. traders, sex workers) to risks of sexual exploitation and violence.\(^{168}\) Large and more remote construction contracts will include women who travel to live in or around the camps, who are potentially highly vulnerable because of their lack of a local support network.

- **Sex work and increased use of drugs and alcohol** are often associated with a mobile and temporary workforce, such as truckers and construction workers, which can further exacerbate the risk of VAWG.\(^{169}\)

- **Modern slavery and human trafficking** is a significant global problem for the construction sector, with high profile cases of both men, women and children trafficked during large infrastructure projects and to work in the construction industry (e.g. construction associated with the 2022 football World Cup in Qatar).\(^{170}\) The links between bonded labour and construction, particularly in the Indian Sub-Continent, are well documented.\(^{171}\)

What are the key opportunities and promising practice?

**Ensuring social safeguards are in place to mitigate and address risks, including sexual harassment policies, Environmental & Social Impact Assessment (ESIA) procedures, reporting frameworks and robust grievance mechanisms** to strengthen the duty of care across a range of actors, including the funding agency, national government, line ministry, contractor(s) and other relevant stakeholders. There should be proper implementation and monitoring of social safeguards through contracts, M&E plans, Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR)

---

\(^{167}\) Choudhury (2013). For example, one female construction worker said, “It becomes more problematic for us when the main men [raj mistry] want to make sexual advances. Since their work is very important, neither sarders nor contractors say anything to them.” (p.893)

\(^{168}\) World Bank Group President Jim Yong Kim (October 2016) in speech launching GGBV Task Force

\(^{169}\) USAID (2015); Gardsbane (2008)

\(^{170}\) Human Rights Watch (2014)

\(^{171}\) Finn (2008)
programmes, and compliance auditing. Reporting mechanisms, including HR management procedures, should allow workers and local community members to report incidences of violence or harassment without fear of reprisal.\textsuperscript{172} These incidences should be fully investigated and disciplinary action taken, where appropriate.

However, it is important to note that there are significant complexities with regard to a contractor’s responsibility for its workers’ behaviour, and associated duty of care for affected communities, outside working hours.\textsuperscript{173} Training on VAWG for the construction workforce (including HR and management, as well as construction workers) can be useful as a preventative and awareness-raising strategy.

Since 2016, the ICED programme has been working with DFID Uganda to help strengthen its capacity and oversight of safeguards on its infrastructure programmes, particularly those that are implemented through third parties and delivery partners (see box). The support is set within a wider context of serious GBV and child protection breaches on a World Bank roads programmes in Uganda, which contributed to the World Bank cancelling the funding to the Uganda Transport Sector Development Project in 2015.\textsuperscript{174}

\textbf{Case study: DFID Uganda’s Safeguard Action Plan for infrastructure programming}

In November 2016, DFID Uganda approached the ICED Facility to support the preparation of an office-wide Safeguards Action Plan to strengthen DFID Uganda’s risk management approach and oversight capacity on safeguards, specifically for infrastructure programmes delivered through partners such as the Uganda National Roads Authority (UNRA), African Development Bank (AfDB) and TradeMark East Africa (TMEA).

During this work, it was agreed that under a second phase of support, ICED would assist DFID Uganda not only to implement the Safeguards Action Plan, but also influence and enhance collaboration with partners, and share learning with wider DFID country offices. Whereas Phase I focused primarily on social safeguards, Phase II includes both Social and Environmental Safeguards for infrastructure projects and draws upon more sector and country specific expertise within the ICED Facility.

In addition, the Phase II work includes the \textbf{design of a new programme to raise ambition and further address child exploitation and GBV on road construction programmes}. The new programme will consist of a TA component to the Government of Uganda’s Ministry of Gender, Labour and Social Development and a fund providing grant support to NGOs and CSOs working on GBV/child protection in the areas where major road construction is taking place. This work demonstrates DFIDU’s commitment and ambition on tackling GBV and child protection on infrastructure programmes, and forms part of the DFID-wide increased interest in rigorous risk management and safeguards as DFID moves to expanding the portfolio on infrastructure and economic development.

\textsuperscript{172} USAID (2015)
\textsuperscript{173} Personal communication, Ian Curtis (24 March 2017)
\textsuperscript{174} Serious allegations of sexual misconduct and abuse by contractor staff, including many cases of child sexual abuse and teenage pregnancies caused by road workers, sexual harassment of female employees, and an increased presence of sex workers, along with contractual breaches related to workers’ issues, social and environmental concerns, poor project performance (World Bank, 2016). Although the World Bank cancelled the funding, GoU/UNRA continued with the project.
**Ensuring a safe working environment for women construction workers**, free from harassment and fear of violence. For example, CARE’s EU-funded project ‘Labour Rights for Female Construction Workers’ (2016-2018)\(^{175}\) aims to address challenges faced by women working in Cambodia’s construction industry. An estimated 20–40% of construction workers in Phnom Penh are female; many have relocated from rural areas of Cambodia to find work and face low pay, security and threats from male construction workers. Project activities include capacity building of female peer leaders, creation of Technical Working Groups on worker rights, and capacity building of 300 private sector employers in the construction sector.

**Fair recruitment and building in an anti-trafficking prevention component** can help reduce vulnerability to trafficking, sexual exploitation, and violence during construction. The UK’s (2015) *Modern Slavery Act* and the appointment of an Independent Modern Slavery Commissioner includes provisions dealing with support and protection for victims. The Asian Development Bank (ADB) has also supported a range of anti-trafficking awareness raising and vulnerability reduction components in their construction projects. For example, a social assessment as part of the ADB’s Road Connectivity Sector Project in Nepal identified girls and women of the age groups 11-25 years old and boys of 6-12 years old as groups at risk to human trafficking for labour or sex work. An anti-trafficking component was therefore built into the project to raise awareness of trafficking amongst road construction workers, transport operators, female sex workers, labour migrants, and populations living along the road corridors.\(^{176}\)

**Social norm change targeted at construction workers** There is also potential to prevent VAWG through workplace programmes aimed at changing harmful social norms, although to date there have been few interventions in the construction industry. One example is the preventative health programme ‘Men at Work’ in Australia, which involves group activities targeted at men in a range of industries, including construction. The programme provides a supportive environment for men to question their own attitudes, behaviour and use of violence, and thus instigate change.\(^{177}\)

---

**Key reading:**


The *World Bank’s Global GBV Task Force* is currently developing a set of recommendations and strategies to identify threats and prevent and respond to violence in World Bank projects, including construction of large infrastructure projects (report due out mid-2017)

---

\(^{175}\) Project Profile: ‘Labour Rights for Female Construction Workers’ [http://www.care-cambodia.org/lrfcw](http://www.care-cambodia.org/lrfcw)

\(^{176}\) World Bank (2009)

\(^{177}\) Victorian Community Council Against Violence (VCCAV) (2004)
SECTION 3: What are the conditions for success? Examples of promising practice

3.1 Introduction

DFID’s ICED programme maps out a continuum for mainstreaming gender and inclusion in urban and infrastructure programmes, through its Gender and Inclusion Framework. It guides programming from addressing needs and vulnerabilities as a minimum level of ambition (‘do minimum’), to interventions that will build individual assets, capabilities and opportunities (‘empowerment’), through to those that seek institutional and societal change (‘transformation’). The framework acknowledges that not all DFID urban and infrastructure programmes can be transformational, but all programmes should respond to the needs and vulnerabilities of marginalised groups as a minimum requirement.

ICED Gender and Inclusion framework for transformation\textsuperscript{178}

This section sets out what infrastructure and urban programmes need to do to move towards ‘transformation’ on violence against women and girls. It recognises that some of these actions take time and may not all be appropriate, depending on the scale, ambition and timeframe of the programme. However, this transformational agenda is crucial for helping to raise the level of ambition of each programme that ICED supports.\textsuperscript{179}

\textsuperscript{178} The matrix has been adapted from a version developed by Moser (2016) that demonstrates the difference between interventions that focus on empowerment of individuals and those that had the potential for structural transformation.

\textsuperscript{179} ICED (2016)
3.2 Women and girls as agents of change

Women and girls are experts on their own experiences of safety and inclusion, and as such, should be key agents of change in the process of building safer and more inclusive cities. Collective action is recognised as a key mechanism for transformative change and cuts across the seven entry points outlined in Section 2. Various tools have been developed to help support the process of empowering women and girls to assert their expertise and engage with urban and transport stakeholders to address the root causes of gender inequality and violence. Examples include women’s safety audits and participatory methodologies for working on gender, violence and WASH to identify and monitor risks.

Plan International’s Because I am a Girl: Urban programme has also designed participatory tools to explore issues of safety and inclusion with adolescent girls, as well as build the capacities of adolescent girls and boys to speak about and act on issues of safety and inclusion. Tools include: the Social Cartography Tool to creatively map girls’ current use of space as well as their ideal vision of their own city; Girls Opportunity Star (see diagram) to explore how girls perceive the seven elements which are deemed necessary for cities to be safe and inclusive for adolescent girls; and Girls Safety Walk to identify factors that make girls feel safe and unsafe in their community.

However, women and girls face risks of emotional and even physical and sexual violence when participating in urban and infrastructure programming, particularly when women take on roles that are perceived to be men’s roles. For example, DFID’s guidance on gender, violence and WASH notes that women may face abuse and violence when becoming part of a WASH committee or accepting a paid job (e.g. pump mechanic). DFID’s urban and infrastructure programmes should have clear procedures for protecting women and girls who participate, for example clear codes of conduct and policies for protection, bullying and harassment with mechanisms for enforcement.

---

180 WICI (2012)
181 SHARE (2014)
182 See SHARE (2014) toolkit for examples of codes of conduct and standards for professional conduct in the WASH sector
3.3 Tackling the social norms that drive violence

To achieve long-term transformation, it is important to design interventions that address the deeply rooted social norms that perpetuate violence against women and girls. Social norms are shared beliefs about what is typical and appropriate behaviour within a particular group of people. They can be defined as a rule of behaviour that people in a group conform to because they believe: (a) most other people in the group do conform to it (i.e. it is ‘typical’ behaviour); and (b) most other people in the group believe they ought to conform to it (i.e. it is ‘appropriate’ behaviour).\(^{183}\) Social norms drive violence in two ways:\(^{184}\)

1. Some harmful or violent behaviours are held in place by social norms: shared beliefs that the violent behaviour is typical and appropriate.
2. Other violent behaviours, such as intimate partner violence, may not be held in place by beliefs that the specific behaviour is typical and appropriate. However, they are underpinned by other beliefs and other social norms around gender roles, family privacy, male authority that in turn create expectations that perpetuate men’s use of violence.

The goal of a social norms intervention should be to create new social expectations by emphasising positive descriptive norms around violence (e.g. ‘I listen when a girl says no’). Rather than reaffirm negative norms (e.g. ‘1 in 3 women worldwide are a victim of violence’), campaigns should emphasise the positive (e.g. ‘74% of men would intervene to prevent a sexual assault’).

Changing individual attitudes is not enough, however; public debate and dialogue is needed so that individuals hear from others in their reference group who may be changing their attitudes towards violence against women, and so their expectations also change. Role models, including celebrities and public figures, are also important for persuading people of the benefits of new behaviour and value of adopting new norms.\(^{185}\)

Edutainment, such as TV and radio programming, can also have a powerful influence on the social norms that perpetuate VAWG. For example, DFID is currently funding an innovative three-year media project in the Occupied Palestinian Territories to reduce VAWG, including a scripted drama series, a sketch comedy programme, and a national multimedia campaign.\(^{186}\)

---

\(^{183}\) Alexander-Scott et al (2016); Heise (2016)

\(^{184}\) Heise (2016)

\(^{185}\) Heise (2016)

\(^{186}\) Part of the What Works to Prevent VAWG global research programme. For more information see: the project Using Innovative Media to End Violence against Women and Girls through Community Education and Outreach.
DFID’s guidance note on Shifting Social Norms to Tackle VAWG provides further ideas for how to address harmful social norms in the context of programming to prevent VAWG. However, it also notes that community-level interventions can be more challenging in urban areas where it is harder to define the ‘community’. Equally, however, urban spaces and transportation can create opportunities for women to model new social norms and roles (e.g. bus drivers, taxi drivers) in the public space and working outside the home.

Although some programmes have been able to change social norms among a specific social group within a relatively short time frame (e.g. SASA! in Uganda lasted 32 months), it is important to recognise that changing harmful social norms at scale can take many years, even decades.\(^\text{187}\) DFID’s theory of change for tackling VAWG notes that different sorts of changes take different time periods to be achieved, with changes to social norms (including behaviours and practices) taking longer. It therefore recommends realistic timeframes and careful sequencing of interventions over the short, medium and long-term.\(^\text{188}\) For example, a key finding of the evaluation of the Madhya Pradesh Safe Cities Initiative (2012-2016) – a component of the DFID-funded Madhya Pradesh Urban Infrastructure Investment Program (MPUIIP) in India – was the need for longer timeframes for social norm change (see box).

---

**DFID’s Madhya Pradesh Safe Cities Initiative (2012-2016), India**

The Safe Cities Initiative aimed to tackle violence against women and girls in four cities of Madhya Pradesh (Bhopal, Indore, Jabalpur, and Gwalior). Unlike most other VAWG initiatives, the programme tackled both intimate partner violence as well as violence experienced in public spaces, through targeted interventions with women’s self-help groups and work with men and boys. An impact evaluation (randomised control trial in 250 slums) found some evidence that the life skills module with men and boys was beginning to challenge harmful gender norms. However, changing deeply engrained norms takes time and the short three-year duration of the programme wasn’t long enough to see major shifts in attitudes, norms and behaviours. The evaluation concluded that future urban infrastructure and safe cities interventions aiming for transformational change at scale may require higher intensity and consistent programming over a longer period of time.

(Source: Holden et al, 2016)

---

### 3.4 Addressing VAWG through coordinated urban planning and governance

A previous study under the ICED programme identified effective governance and joined-up planning between government agencies as a key precondition to ensure that infrastructure achieves its potential to expand economic opportunities for

\(^{187}\) Alexander-Scott et al (2012)

\(^{188}\) DFID (2012)
The same can be said of addressing VAWG within urban and infrastructure programming, particularly given that the prevention and response to violence relies on coordinated action across multiple sectors, including health, education and social services, legal and security actors, and the community. Evidence has in particular highlighted this in the context of emergencies and humanitarian assistance, where public service delivery is disrupted or lacking, and where a multi-sectoral approach helps to ensure more responsive action to address VAWG. A joined-up approach also ensures that actors in different sectors are aware of and understand the risks and opportunities related to urban and infrastructure programming, and have the political will to address these issues, and that adequate resources are allocated to VAWG in budgets and funding allocations.

Improving urban infrastructure and integrating gender-responsive public services into municipal planning also necessitates women’s participation at all stages. ActionAid’s research into women’s experience of violence in seven cities highlighted the need to apply gender analysis and for women to be involved in the planning and budgeting of public service design and implementation from the outset. Governance-based movements to promote women’s safety in urban public spaces, such as Toronto’s Safe City Committee (1989-1999) and the Safe Delhi Initiative (2009-present), link up with infrastructure projects and involve the development of ‘partnerships’ between elected officials, public servants, community based groups and researchers. The joined-up model, drawing on urban planning and design, aims to mobilise power, information and resources to push for urban social change to promote women’s security.

**Joined-up urban planning model for improving women’s safety, India**

The safety audits undertaken by Jagori, a women’s resource centre in India, which mapped a range of public spaces and safety issues in Delhi, resulted in a partnership with a local transport corporation, run by a supportive bureaucrat. The partnership led to training on gender and violence for almost 3,800 bus drivers and conductors employed by the public service. Under the UN-Trust Fund supported Gender Inclusive Cities Programme, new partnerships were later developed with local government and private sector urban planners. For example, an organisation contracted to redesign a major road in Delhi used Jagori’s data in their road redesign, and included new bus stop designs, space for slower moving traffic, and improved public toilets and public spaces. Eventually, local urban planning design guidelines incorporated women’s safety concerns.

(Source: Whitzman et al, 2014)

---

189 Jacobson et al (2016)
190 World Bank, Global Women’s Institute and IDB (2014) VAWG Resource Guide
191 Inter-Agency Standing Committee (2015)
192 ActionAid (2015)
193 Whitzman et al (2014)
3.5 Digital innovation

New technologies and ‘digital infrastructure’ are increasingly being used in ever more inventive ways to monitor, respond to, and prevent violence against women and girls. Mobile phones, smart phones, apps, twitter and other social media are becoming much more accessible throughout the global south and across socio-economic and demographic boundaries. Mobile phone ownership in Africa is increasing rapidly and in 2015, 75% of African adults owned a mobile phone (19% owned a smartphone and 56% owned a mobile phone, but not a smartphone). However, variations in network coverage, electricity supplies and financial constraints mean that mobile technologies cannot be used everywhere. The data is not disaggregated by rural/urban, but it is likely that urban coverage is significantly higher than rural. There are also significant gender gaps, with fewer women in Africa owning mobile phones than men. For example, in Uganda 77% of men and 51% of women own mobiles.

Digital tools such as HarassMap and SafetiPin (see box) have been used to share experiences, raise awareness, seek support and prevent sexual harassment in cities. These new technologies are also able to gather user-generated data to help local authorities and the police to address concerns around safety and inclusion in cities and on transport.

There is also potential for digital innovation to provide real-time information on transport services, which can help provide a sense of security for women and girls to know how long they have to wait before their transport arrives, and if necessary reduce their waiting time in public.

Digital initiatives that appear most successful are ones that:

- Offer two way communication with users and are situated within a web of support and information for women and girls that experience violence and harassment;
- Are linked to a web of activists that also provide face-to-face contact, raise awareness of the service and use the data gathered to challenge perceptions; or
- Where users are supported by implementing agencies to use the technology to map incidences in their communities / services.

However, these are new forms of data collection, and we need more research into how they can best be used, as well as possible risks.

194 Poushter (2016) 
195 Matilla (2011) 
196 Pew Research Centre (2015) 
197 Gekoski et al (2015) 
198 Bell (2013)
SafetiPin

SafetiPin is an organisation that seeks to use technology and data to make cities more inclusive, safe and free from violence for women and others. We build apps to collect information and engage with individuals and city stakeholders. At the core of the app is the Safety Audit. It consists of a set of 9 parameters that together contribute to the perception of safety. The parameters are lighting, openness, visibility, crowd, gender diversity, security, walk path and public transport. Each safety audit results in a pin on the specific location where the audit was performed and also records the time and date. All the pins are visible on the app. The pins are also aggregated to produce a Safety Score for a neighbourhood. Data is collected either through users or through photographs. Safetipin has collected data in over 20 cities in India and around the world. The data collected in some of these cities has been used in innovative ways.

In **Bogota**, the app has been used to map safety issues along the city's bike paths and 2262 points have been mapped. This is being used by the Secretary of Women and Secretary of Transport departments to make informed decisions about where to put resources to make these spaces safer focusing on sidewalks and non-motorised transport. For example, this data has been used to decide locations of CCTV's.

In **Delhi**, the data has been used to identify dark spots and has been shared with key stakeholders who are working on fixing these after which Safetipin will conduct another round of audits to ascertain whether the safety score in these areas have improved and women feel safer. In one low income neighbourhood, the data from audits was shared in a public space so that the community could interact with it and give their recommendations. Further the Delhi Police have incorporated the findings and have improved police patrolling in areas that were identified as unsafe.

In **Nairobi**, the data was used to redesign a public space in a neighbourhood Eastleigh with participation from the community who deliberated on the data. The main street of a neighbourhood was made more accessible through providing space for different activities like leisure or shopping as well as making the area brightly lit. This ensured that people were out and using the public space, even at night.
**NEXT STEPS: GETTING STARTED**

This guide provides an introductory framework for how to address VAWG through programming and policy dialogue on infrastructure and cities.

Each section provides guidance on where to go next for further reading.

There are also some well-established programmes and organisations that provide a good starting point for engagement at policy or country programming level (see Annex 3). Examples of existing initiatives to learn from or share experience with include:

- UN Women's [Safe Cities and Safe Public Spaces](#) (2010-present)
- UN Trust Fund to End Violence against Women’s [Gender-Inclusive Cities programme](#) (2008-2011)
- UNICEF's [Child Friendly City Initiative](#) (1996-present)
- ActionAid’s [Safe Cities for Women](#) programme (2011-present)
- Plan International's [Because I am a Girl Urban](#) programme (2012-present)

**Contact ICED for more help**

The ICED facility is also available for practical support to advisers and country offices in embedding VAWG in infrastructure and cities programming. For all enquiries, the point of contact will be:

**ICED Gender and Inclusion Technical Manager:**

Vidya Naidu – vidya.naidu@sddirect.org.uk / +44 7773 796 756
ANNEX 1: BIBLIOGRAPHY

ActionAid (2016) Fearless: Women’s rights organisations key to ending violence against women and girls in our rapidly urbanising world, Briefing Note

http://www.actionaid.org/publications/women-and-city-iii


ActionAid (2013) Women and the City II; Combating violence against women and girls in public spaces – The role of public services, London: ActionAid


Crockett, C. McCleary-Sills, J., Cooper, B. and Brown, B. (2016) *Violence against women resource guide: Brief on violence against older women*. World Bank, Global Women’s Institute, IDB, ICRW.


Lee, H (2016) *Gender and social inclusion (GESI) considerations for urban and infrastructure programmes in fragile and conflict affected states (FCAS)*, London: ICED.


Mariotti, C and Bridonneau, S (2016) *How can public policy enhance female employment and empower women economically as countries urbanize?* EPS PEAKS Helpdesk Request, London: ODI.
Massey, K (2011) *Insecurity and Shame, Exploration of the impact of the lack of sanitation on women in the slums of Kampala, Uganda, Briefing Note*. London: SHARE Consortium


Moser (2016) *Catalyst Paper* – Internal document developed for ICED


Norwegian Refugee Council (2014) Life can change: Securing housing, land and property rights for displaced women, Oslo: Norwegian Refugee Council  


http://www.pewglobal.org/2015/04/15/cell-phones-in-africa-communication-lifeline/


Pouschter, J (2016) Smartphone Ownership and Internet Usage Continues to Climb in Emerging Economies, Pew Research Center  

http://r4d.dfid.gov.uk/pdf/outputs/GovPEAKS/HDQ1337.pdf


Safetipin (2016) *Enhancing Last Mile Connectivity: a safety analysis of the Lok Kalyan Metro Station*, Gurgaon: Safetipin
http://www.safetipin.com/resources/files/12%20Lok%20Kalyan_Safetipin.pdf


SHARE (2014) *Violence, Gender and WASH: A Practitioners Toolkit* http://violence-wash.lboro.ac.uk/toolkit/


http://journals.sagepub.com/doi/pdf/10.1177/0956247813479086


UN Women (2013a) Street Harassment Study Egypt, New York: UN Women


WHO, the South African Medical Research Council (MRC), and the London School of Hygiene & Tropical Medicine (LSHTM) (2013) Global and regional estimates of violence against women: prevalence and health effects of intimate partner violence and non-partner sexual violence. Geneva: WHO http://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/10665/85239/1/9789241564625_eng.pdf


http://femmesetvilles.org/downloadable/learningfromwomen.pdf

https://openknowledge.worldbank.org/handle/10986/16733


Annex 2: International commitments on VAWG and safe and inclusive urban spaces

In recent years, there has been an increasing momentum surrounding the issue of women and girls’ safety in urban public spaces, partly a result of the efforts of global women’s movement as well as a number of high-profile and well publicised cases. A number of global commitments have underlined the increasing prioritisation of the issue. The Sustainable Development Goals, adopted in 2015, include the specific goal 11 to ‘make cities and human settlements inclusive, safe, resilient and sustainable’, with a target that directly contributes to addressing women and girls’ safety in public spaces. In 2013, the Commission on the Status of Women incorporated for the first time a number of statements in its ‘Agreed Conclusions’ that relate directly to women’s safety in public and urban spaces. The conclusions call on states to “increase measures to protect women and girls from violence and harassment, including sexual harassment and bullying, in both public and private spaces, to address security and safety, through awareness raising, involvement of local communities, crime prevention laws, policies, programmes such as the Safe Cities Initiative of the United Nations.”

The New Urban Agenda (NUA), adopted following the United Nations Conference on Housing and Sustainable Urban Development (Habitat III) in October 2016, puts forward a manifesto to create safer, more inclusive and sustainable cities, with the aim of influencing global urban policy. The NUA notes that it contributes both to the implementation and location of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development, and to achieving SDG goal 11, as outlined above. The NUA sets out its vision of inclusive cities including ‘preventing and eliminating all forms of discrimination, violence, and harassment against women and girls in private and public spaces’, and supporting ‘the provision of well-designed networks of safe, inclusive for all inhabitants, accessible, green, and quality public spaces and streets, free from crime and violence, including sexual harassment and gender-based violence’.

Three International Conferences on Women’s Safety have also been organised, bringing together representatives of women’s organisations and networks,

199 Fulu, E. (2016) Born to be free: a regionals study of interventions to enhance women and girls’ safety and mobility in public spaces – Asia and the Pacific Region. United Nations Entity for Gender Equality and the Empowerment of Women (UN Women)
200 Fulu, E. (2016) Born to be free: a regionals study of interventions to enhance women and girls’ safety and mobility in public spaces – Asia and the Pacific Region. United Nations Entity for Gender Equality and the Empowerment of Women (UN Women)
grassroots organisations and NGOs, cities and municipalities, police services, government departments, research institutions and UN agencies. The conferences both represented and added to the developing knowledge and networks surrounding how to increase the safety of women in urban areas and increase the visibility of women in this work.\textsuperscript{203} The conferences resulted in the Montreal Declaration in 2002, the Bogotá Declaration in 2004 and the Delhi Declaration in 2010, each setting out commitments and actions on VAWG and a reaffirmation that ‘Women’s and girls’ right to the city includes the right to live free from violence and fear, in more equitable, democratic and inclusive cities’ and setting out a vision for ‘Inclusive cities that allow movement, day and night, to all parts of the city for all women and girls, including the poor and those with disabilities and special needs, so that they have equitable access to water, sanitation, transport, energy, secure tenure and housing, economic development and recreation’.\textsuperscript{204}

UN Women also held three SAFE Cities and Public Spaces Global Leaders’ Fora in Cairo in 2011 and New Delhi in 2015 and Mexico in 2017. The fora tied into their global flagship initiative ‘Safe Cities and Safe Public Spaces’, launched in 2010, building on their ‘Safe Cities Free of Violence against Women and Girls’ global programme. It works in collaboration with numerous actors and has involved 22 cities so far, working to develop, implement and evaluate tools and policies to address and respond to sexual violence across a range of contexts.

\textsuperscript{203} Margaret Shaw, Caroline Andrew, Carolyn Whitzman, Fran Klodawsky, Kalpana Viswanath and Crystal Legacy (2013) Building Inclusive Cities—Women’s Safety and the Right to the City. Routledge.

\textsuperscript{204} Building Inclusive Cities and Communities: Delhi Declaration on Women’s Safety (2010)
Annex 3: Safe Cities programming

Various initiatives are being implemented either at a national or international level aimed at improving women and girls’ safety and mobility in public spaces, including:

- **Safe Cities and Safe Public Spaces** (2010-present) is UN Women’s global flagship initiative. It began with founding programmes in Quito (Ecuador), Cairo (Egypt), New Delhi (India), Port Moresby (Papua New Guinea), and Kigali (Rwanda) and now includes over 22 cities to date.

- **Gender-Inclusive Cities programme** (2008-2011), a three year initiative funded by the United Nations Trust Fund to End Violence against Women, which aimed to create inclusive cities that respect the right of all people, including women, to live, work and move around without fear or difficulty. The programme was implemented in Dar es Salaam (Tanzania), Delhi (India), Petrozavodsk (Russia) and Rosario (Argentina).

- **Child Friendly City Initiative** (1996-present) led globally by UNICEF includes a focus on protection from violence, abuse and exploitation and currently includes cities in over 50 countries.

- **Safe Cities for Women programme** (2011-present) developed by ActionAid and its partners and implemented in over ten of ActionAid’s country programmes across Africa, Asia and Europe, with the aim of improving safety, mobility and access to services for women and girls, including reducing violence against women in public spaces and promoting gender inclusive urban policies.

- **Because I am a Girl Urban programme** (2012-present) developed by Plan International with partner organizations UN-HABITAT and Women in Cities International, aims to build safe, accountable and inclusive cities with and for adolescent girls in all their diversity. This programme has been implemented in five cities around the world: Cairo (Egypt), New Delhi (India), Hanoi (Viet Nam), Kampala (Uganda) and Lima (Peru).

---

205 In partnership with leading women’s organizations, organizations, UN agencies, and more than 70 global and local partners

206 In partnership with organizations and research institutions such as the Bernard Van Leer Foundation, Save the Children, Plan International, The Innocenti Research Centre of UNICEF and the Children’s Environment’s Research Group at the City University of New York
### Annex 4: Examples of indicators

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sample indicators</th>
<th>For all entry points</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Changes in VAWG attitudes and behaviors using knowledge, attitudes, and perception surveys</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Changes in VAWG incidence and prevalence rates over time</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Safe space & security | • Increased cooperation between communities and police towards reducing GBV incidence |
|                      | • Effective participation of women in community/neighborhood development associations/committees |
|                      | • Increased cooperation between communities and police around VAWG |
|                      | • Implementation of safety policies in neighborhoods and communities |
|                      | • Implementation of gender equality and VAWG prevention policies in government agencies, which also affect employment policies of government contractors |

| Transport | • Number of employers adopting gender- and VAWG-sensitive employment policies |
|           | • Implementation of safety policies in neighborhoods and communities |
|           | • Increase in number of women in management and implementation positions in government transportation agencies |
|           | • Women participate in capacity-building programs on the implementation and management of transportation systems |
|           | • Implementation of gender equality and VAWG prevention policies in government transportation agencies, which also affect employment policies of government contractors |

| Water and sanitation | • Percentage of population using improved water and sanitation services |
|                      | • Number of toilets and washing facilities per household |
|                      | • Percentage of income spent by women and men in accessing water and sanitation services |
|                      | • Decreased distance from households to water resources |
|                      | • Time saved by women using improved water and sanitation facilities |
|                      | • Increased number of women in water management |
|                      | • Evidence that public facilities have separate toilets and places for women, according to needs identified by women (e.g., public toilets, community centers, emergency shelters, municipal offices, bus and train stations, public markets) |

| Energy | • Improved access to electricity by poor rural households, increased number of women having access to renewable energy supplies and nonpolluting technologies |
|        | • Improved affordability for poor households (including those headed by women) |
|        | • Increased number of women working and living in a risk-free environment |
|        | • Percentage of women represented in electricity users groups, committees, cooperatives, utility management level, energy board, and other decision-making bodies |
|        | • Percentage of women participating in policy formulation public consultation meetings |
|        | • Number of project staff and staff of energy agencies and utilities receiving gender awareness training |
|        | • Gender equality performance and VAWG prevention of energy sector agencies or utilities improved (e.g., human resources strategy) |
|        | • Sector policy or strategy explicitly highlighting gender equality |

---

2017 Source: USAID’s 2015 Toolkit on GBV prevention in energy and infrastructure programmes; DFID programme logframes; Asian Development Bank’s (2013) Toolkit on Gender Equality Results and Indicators
| Land & housing rights | • Effective participation of women in community/neighborhood development associations/committees  
• Percentage change in the number of women with secure tenure in program or project areas  
• Examples of changes to housing design, location and land use planning, or zoning to improve women's safety (any evidence this has involved consultation with women?) |
|----------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Formal workers       | • Number of employers adopting gender- and VAWG-sensitive employment policies  
• Number of training / awareness raising sessions on VAWG  
• Number and percentage of women and men attending VAWG training / awareness raising, by type of stakeholder  
• Number and percentage of women and men who access employment or increase their incomes due to improved infrastructure and services |
| Informal workers     | • Evidence of legislative and regulatory changes to protect women informal workers  
• Women's perceptions of changes in safety, convenience, and corruption associated with market upgrading and reforms  
• Number of markets upgraded to include private, clean, and safe sanitation for women vendors and buyers  
• Number of markets upgraded to include safe spaces for children  
• Number of women market vendors and associations consulted on infrastructure upgrades and reforms to market management and operations  
• Examples of changes to the design, operation, fee collection, security arrangements, waste management, and maintenance of markets due to consultation with or advocacy by women vendors |